

Ministry of Civil Aviation
Rajiv Gandhi Bhawan, New Delhi-110003

Minutes of the Meeting of the Appellate Committee for height clearance held on
23rd March, 2016

Reference Ministry of Civil Aviation letter No. AV.20036/66/2000-AAI dated 15-10-2012 read with letters dated 31-12-2012 and dated 04-01-2013, the Appellate Committee constituted to consider appeal/grievance made by different applicants with regard to the height allocated to them by AAI for their construction vis-à-vis the height sought by them, held its meeting under the Chairmanship of Joint Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation (MOCA) on 23rd March, 2016.

The following Committee members were present:-

- | | | | |
|----|---------------|---|-------------------|
| 1. | Sh. A K Dutta | - | Member (ANS), AAI |
| 2. | Sh. J S Rawat | - | Jt. DGCA |
| 3. | Sh. K. Gohain | - | Technical Expert |

The following appeal cases were taken up in which aeronautical study were conducted as per the Aeronautical Study guidelines approved by the competent authority which also included the Expert Committee recommendations for the maximum permissible penetration of OLS. The Expert Committee while arriving at their decision in each case had also considered and concluded that the safety and regularity of aircraft operations at the particular airport will not be affected.

The **Aeronautical Study cases** that were brought up in this Committee Meeting by GM (NOC) are as detailed below:-

AERONAUTICAL STUDY CASES

1. **M/s Uma Enterprises Pvt. Ltd. & Gauri Shanker & Others, Jaipur.**

Case No.: NR/2014/131
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/93/2014
NOCAS ID : JAIP/NORTH/B/022814/22245
Site Address: Khasra No. 76 to 83, 83/509, 88, 89, 90, 81/532, 88/1, 89/2, 79/530, 80/531, 83/529, 84, 85/1, 89/1, 90/1 Village Durgapur, Tehsil Sanganer, Jaipur.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in IHS and is 3992m from Rwy 27 of Jaipur Airport.

S. K. Puri



The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 511.25m vide their letter dated 07.4.2014 against which they were granted 429.96m vide AAI letter dated 21.4.2014. Aeronautical Study conducted for 511.25m AMSL.

The case was heard in Appellate Committee Meeting of 30th July, 2015 and authorization was issued for proposed 11 towers vide AAI letter dated 19.08.2015.

Applicant requested review for the revised site layout plan and submitted Jaipur Development Authority letter dated 14.12.2015. They also requested for review of permissible height w.r.t. ADS-B application.

The case was re-examined at AAI and the maximum permissible top elevation is summarized as per below table:

Annexure A

Tower No.	Distance from Runway end (mts)	Max Height due AGA	Max Height due PANS-ops	Max Height due CNS	Max PTE (mts AMSL)
TOWER-1	3999.71	474.84	588.27	466.2	466.2
TOWER-2	4008.8	475.32	588.27	466.48	466.48
TOWER-3	4024.34	475.96	588.27	466.91	466.91
TOWER-4	4031.34	476.25	588.27	467.15	467.15
TOWER-5	4041.65	476.67	588.27	467.42	467.42
TOWER-6	4049.33	476.99	588.27	467.67	467.67
TOWER-7	4107.29	479.37	588.27	468.3	468.3
TOWER-8	4143.51	480.86	588.27	468.68	468.68
TOWER-9	4176.42	482.21	588.27	469.02	469.02
TOWER-10	4123.82	480.05	588.27	467.95	467.95
TOWER-11	4078.26	478.18	588.27	467.46	467.46

The Committee took note of the applicant submitting revised layout plan and requesting for review. The Committee also observed that the Aeronautical Study was conducted for a height of 511.25m AMSL as was initially requested by the applicant. The applicant further stated that the site elevation as 403m AMSL as against the earlier submitted value of 413.70m AMSL.

Committees' Decision:

The site elevation is to be verified by AAI and permissible top elevation for each of the 11 towers as indicated in the Aeronautical Study result, be checked whether ADS-B criteria as approved has been incorporated and thereafter re-submit to the Appellate Committee.

2. Shri Jai Ram More, C/o Shri Y.E Rafik, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/400

CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/26/2015

NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/080814/55402

Site Address: CTS No.1(Pt) of Village Oshivara Andheri (W) Oshivara, Mumbai

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Conical Surface** and is 895m from IHS of Juhu Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 161.28m AMSL vide their letter dated 21.8.2014 against which they were granted 122.59m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 07.10.2014. Subsequently, the applicant requested for revised height of 149m AMSL vide their letter dated 11.3.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 27.8.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 148.25m AMSL.

The Aeronautical Study report was examined in the Appellate Committee and it is observed there from that the permissible top elevation is 118m AMSL being restricted from IAL consideration. The Appellate Committee also noted that the height granted by AAI initially on 7.10.2014 was 122.59m AMSL. The Committee further noted that the permissible height from AGA and CNS parameters is higher than the original granted height of 122.59m AMSL. The committee was informed by AAI that the permissible top elevation is restricted to 118m AMSL on application of proposed PBN procedures for Runway 14. The Appellate Committee opined that the matter needs to be examined from the legal point of view as the permissible top elevation from the Aeronautical Study report, has been arrived from application of a procedure which is at the draft stage and awaiting DGCA approval, and also the height derived from such a procedure is less than the height granted initially by AAI in October, 2014. The Committee also noted that the PBN procedure referred to in the Aeronautical Study is under development and will be published after DGCA approval. The Committee desired that this process is to be expedited.

Committees' Decision:

The matter to be taken up for a legal opinion as to whether the earlier granted height 122.59m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 07.10.2014 will prevail or the height, arrived at by Aeronautical Study, be restricted to 118m AMSL. The Aeronautical Study report along with legal opinion to be re-submitted to the Appellate Committee.

3. M/s Sree Dhanya Homes Pvt. Ltd., Trivandrum, Shri G. Chandra Babu,

Case No.: MM/207/2013/T.V/10/2013

CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/201/2014

NOCAS ID: THIR/SOUTH/B/121214/81312

Site Address: S.No. 539/6, Attipara, Trivandrum, Kerala.

S.K. Raman



As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Conical Surface** and is 4065m from Rwy 14 of Trivandrum Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 92.735m AMSL vide their letter dated 25.2.2013 against which they were granted 53m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 22.4.2013. Subsequently, the applicant requested for revised height of 92.73m AMSL vide their letter dated 15.11.2014.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 30.7.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 91m AMSL as per the revised request of the applicant in the meeting.

The Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested 91m AMSL is permissible from AGA, IAL and CNS criteria.

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 91m AMSL to be issued.

4. M/s N. Srinivas C/o M/s G.A.R. Hotels and Estates Pvt Ltd., Hyderabad.

Case No.: HY/06/2015
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/62/2015
NOCAS ID: HYDE/South/B/122214/82982
Site Address: Proposed construction of Hotel Building in survey No. 129/73/3 (Part), Road No.3, Banjara Hills, Hyderabad, Telangana State.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3927.39m from Rwy 09 of Hyderabad Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 639.02m AMSL online dated 22.12.2014 which was rejected vide AAI letter dated 24.2.2015, as the site elevation is higher than the permissible height. Subsequently, the applicant again requested for same height of 639.02m AMSL through Aeronautical Study vide their letter dated 14.7.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 29.9.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 639.02m AMSL.

This Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested 639.02m AMSL is permissible from IAL and CNS criteria and that from AGA criteria the height permissible is 618.76m AMSL.

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 618.76m AMSL to be issued.



S.K. Purwar

5. Commissioner of Police, Hyderabad.

Case No.: HY/298/2015
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/81/2015
NOCAS ID: HYDE/SOUTH/B/081415/155592
Site Address: Proposed Construction of Hyderabad City Police Commissionerate Head Quarters on OPEN LAND in Plot Nos 53 and 54 in Survey No 403 T S Nos 24/P and 5/P Block H Ward Nos 9 and 10 of Shaikpet Village, SHAIKPET Village Road No 12 Banjara Hills, Hyd Dist., AP

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Conical Surface** and is 4982.02m from Rwy09 of Begumpet Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 714m AMSL vide their letter dated 14.8.2015 against which they were granted 623.90m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 29.8.2015. Subsequently, the applicant requested for revised height of 714m AMSL vide their letter dated NIL.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 29.9.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for the height of 714m AMSL as requested by the applicant.

This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the proposal involves height for 2 separate towers (Tower-A and Tower-B). The Committee also observed that the Aeronautical Study report does not permit the requested height of 714m AMSL from the AGA, IAL and CNS criteria. The permissible height for both the towers are also different i.e. Tower-A – 662.46m AMSL and Tower-B – 660.16m AMSL.

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of Tower-A and Tower-B to be issued as 662.46m AMSL and 660.16m AMSL respectively.

6. M/s Charmee Enterprises, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/138
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/41/2015
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/052113/011
Site Address: CTS No. 1(pt), 2(pt), 3(pt), 4(pt) & 5(pt) OF Village VILE PARLE, MUMBAI SUBURBAN DISTRICT IN K - EAST Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 2086m from Rwy 14 of Santa Cruz Airport.

S. K. Raman

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 85.75m AMSL vide their letter dated 17.4.2013 against which they were granted 56.90m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 20.8.2013. Subsequently, the applicant requested for revised height of 74.40m AMSL vide their letter dated 18.7.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 27.8.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 74.40m AMSL.

This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested is restricted from IAL Criteria to 62.5m AMSL which is the maximum height permissible.

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 62.5m AMSL to be issued.

7. D.G Balani,C/o Jatin M. Sheth,Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/74
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/148/2014
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/011014/19960
Site Address: CTS No.9 Chandivali,Powai, Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3825m from Rwy 27 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 135.15m AMSL vide their letter dated 30.1.2014 against which they were granted 56.90m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 5.6.2014. Subsequently, the applicant reiterated for same height of 135.15m AMSL vide their letter dated 18.07.14.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 27.8.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 135.15m AMSL.

This Appellate Committee examined the Aeronautical Study report and observed that the proposal includes 5 buildings which were considered in the study and that the permissible height for each of the buildings worked out to;

Wing – A	100.04m AMSL
Wing – B	99.68m AMSL
Wing – C	99.68m AMSL
Wing – D	99.85m AMSL
Wing – E	100.13m AMSL

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height for each of the building viz. A, B, C, D & E respectively as given in the Table above to be issued.

8. **Sh. Vishan S. Lakhani C/o Sh. Ashish R. Solanki, Mumbai.**

Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/311
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/77/2015
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/060614/40539
Site Address: CTS No. C/826, Village Bandra(W), Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3625.91m from Rwy34 of Juhu Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 85m AMSL vide their letter dated 17.6.2014 against which they were granted 56.9m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 9.9.2014. Subsequently, the applicant requested for revised lower height of 79.41m AMSL vide their letter dated 8.8.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 29.9.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 79.41m AMSL.

This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested is admissible from all the criteria i.e. AGA, IAL and CNS

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 79.41m AMSL to be issued.

9. **M/S. Navkar Greens Builder & Developer, Mumbai.**

Case No.: MUM/15/NOCAS/52
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/78/2015
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/121914/82560
Site Address: PROPOSED BUILDING ON PLOT BEARING C.T.S. NO. 8 (PART) OF VILLAGE MAROL AT MAROL MAROSHI ROAD, ANDHERI (EAST), MUMBAI

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3636m from Rwy 14 of Mumbai Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 81.824m AMSL vide their letter dated 19.12.2014 against which they were granted 56.90m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 6.4.2015. Subsequently, the applicant reiterated for same height of 81.824m AMSL vide their letter dated 4.9.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 06.11.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 73.78m AMSL as revised by the applicant in the said meeting.

S. K. Purwar

This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested i.e. 73.78m AMSL is admissible from all the criteria i.e. AGA, IAL and CNS

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 73.78m AMSL to be issued.

10. M/s. Dheeraj Housing Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/250
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/73/2015 Old File No. AAI/20012/126/14
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/040813/023
Site Address: Plot No CTS C/597 & C/598, Village Bandra, Bandra West, Mumbai

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3837m from Rwy 09 of Mumbai Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 85.055m AMSL vide their letter dated 20.5.2013 against which they were granted 56.90m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 9.10.2013. Subsequently, the applicant has requested for reduced height of 73.905m AMSL vide their letter dated 18.8.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 06.11.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 73.90m AMSL.

This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested i.e. 73.90m AMSL is admissible from all the criteria i.e. AGA, IAL and CNS

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 73.90m AMSL to be issued.

11. Shri Harish G. Amin, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/567
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/56/2015
NOCAS ID : SNCR/WEST/B/120314/78819
Site Address: C.T.S.13/11 &13/12 village Mulgaon, Andheri East Mumbai

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3293m from Rwy 14 of Santa Cruz Airport.

S. K. Purohit



The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 74.855m AMSL vide their letter dated 11.12.2014 against which they were granted 56.90m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 26.2.2015. Subsequently, the applicant reiterated for same height of 74.855m AMSL vide their letter dated 29.6.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 29.9.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 74.855m AMSL.

This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested is admissible from all the criteria i.e. AGA, IAL and CNS

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 74.85m AMSL to be issued.

12. M/s Consultants Combine, E.W.S Tenants Association, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/027
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/60/2013
NOCAS ID : SNCR/WEST/B/110811/011
Site Address: CTS No 194A/9/11(Pt.)Plot-B of Village Ghatkopar (East),
Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3774m from Rwy 27 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 128.99m AMSL vide their letter dated 29.6.2012 against which they were granted 56.28m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 25.10.2012. Subsequently, the applicant reiterated for same height of 128.99m AMSL vide their letter dated 21.3.2013. Thereafter, their case was heard in Appellate Committee meeting held on 7.3.2014 in which they revised their request for grant of height of 77.29m AMSL. In the subsequent AC Meeting held on 26.3.2015 again revised as 80m AMSL.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 30.7.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 77.29m AMSL which was confirmed by the applicant in this meeting.

This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested i.e. 77.29m AMSL is admissible from all the criteria i.e. AGA, IAL and CNS

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 77.29m AMSL to be issued.

13. M/s Jai drinks Pvt. Ltd., Jaipur.

Case No.: NR/2012/227

S. K. Rana



CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/66/2015
NOCAS ID : JAIP/NORTH/B/072215/151259
Site Address: Khasra no. 180, 181,184,186, Village Jhalana doongari,
Tehsil Sanganer, Jaipur.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3699m from Rwy 09 of Jaipur Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 456m AMSL vide their letter dated 30.7.2012 against which they were granted 429.96m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 03.8.2012. Subsequently, the applicant reiterated for same height of 456m AMSL vide their letter dated 29.7.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 27.8.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 456m AMSL.

This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested i.e. 456m AMSL is admissible from all the criteria i.e. AGA, IAL and CNS

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 456m AMSL to be issued.

14. M/s Aqua Space Developers Pvt Ltd., Hyderabad.

Case No.: HY/125/2014
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/83/2015
NOCAS ID : HYDE/SOUTH/B/041914/34346
Site Address: Commercial Blocl 1 Plot No 30/A in Survey No 83/1 in Hyderabad Knowledge City, Raidurg Panmaktha Village Serilingampally Mandal, Hyderabad, Andhra Pradesh.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Conical Surface** and is 8454m from Rwy 09 of Hyderabad Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 694m AMSL vide their letter dated 19.4.2014 against which they were granted 649m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 3.6.2014. Subsequently, the applicant requested for revised height of 704m AMSL vide their letter dated 28.9.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 06.11.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 704m AMSL.

This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested is admissible from AGA and CNS criteria only. The permissible height is restricted to 698m AMSL from IAL criteria on account of the visual circling procedure which is in vogue.

Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 698m AMSL to be issued.

S. K. Punwan



15. M/s Saurashtra Chemicals Limited, Porbander.

Case No.: MUM/12/PB/NOCAS/390
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/78/2013
NOCAS ID : PORB/WEST/B/062012/014
Site Address: Survey No. 22, Porbandar-360575, Taluka Dist Porbandar.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3774m from Rwy 09 of Porbander airport.


The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 76.555m AMSL vide their letter dated 26.10.2012 against which they were granted 52.01m AMSL (for Chimney) vide AAI letter dated 15.10.2013 and 52.01m AMSL (for Limekiln) vide letter dated 20.2.2013. Subsequently, the applicant reiterated for same height of 76.555m AMSL vide their letters dated 16.1.2014 and 10.6.2014.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 16.1.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 107m AMSL (for Chimney) and 76.55m AMSL (for Limekiln).


This Appellate Committee examined the report and observed that the height requested for chimney and limekiln is admissible from IAL and CNS criteria only. The report restricts the permissible height from AGA criteria for the chimney as 90.03m AMSL and the permissible height for two limekiln as 76.55m AMSL which is admissible also from IAL and CNS criteria.


Committees' Decision:

The authorization for permissible height of 90.03m AMSL for the chimney and 76.55m AMSL for the limekilns to be issued.


(A.K. Dutta)
MEMBER (ANS), AAI


(J S Rawat)
Jt. DGCA


(K. GOHAIN)
TECHNICAL EXPERT


(ARUN KUMAR)
JT. SECY, MOCA
CHAIRMAN, APPELLATE COMMITTEE

Place: New Delhi
Date: 23rd March 2016

31/3/2016