

**Ministry of Civil Aviation**  
**Rajiv Gandhi Bhawan, New Delhi-110003**

**Minutes of the Meeting of the Appellate Committee for height clearance held on 28<sup>th</sup> July, 2016 - AERONAUTICAL STUDY CASES**

Reference Ministry of Civil Aviation letter No. AV.20036/66/2000-AAI dated 15-10-2012 read with letters dated 31-12-2012 and dated 04-01-2013, the Appellate Committee constituted to consider appeal/grievance made by different applicants with regard to the height allocated to them by AAI for their construction vis-à-vis the height sought by them, held its meeting under the Chairmanship of Joint Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation (MOCA) on 28<sup>th</sup> July, 2016.

The following Committee members were present:-

- |    |               |   |                   |
|----|---------------|---|-------------------|
| 1. | Sh. A K Dutta | - | Member (ANS), AAI |
| 2. | Sh. J S Rawat | - | Jt. DGCA          |
| 3. | Sh. K. Gohain | - | Technical Expert  |

The following appeal cases in which aeronautical study were conducted as per the Aeronautical Study guidelines approved by the competent authority which also included the Expert Committee recommendations for the maximum permissible penetration of OLS. The Expert Committee while arriving at their decision in each case had also considered and concluded that the safety and regularity of aircraft operations at the particular airport will not be affected.

The **Aeronautical Study cases** that were brought up in this Committee Meeting by GM (NOC) are as detailed below:-

**AERONAUTICAL STUDY CASES**

1. **M/s Uma Enterprises Pvt. Ltd. & Gauri Shanker & Others, Jaipur.**

**Case No.:** NR/2014/131  
**CHQ File No.:** AAI/20012/93/2014  
**NOCAS ID :** JAIP/NORTH/B/022814/22245  
**Site Address:** Khasra No. 76 to 83, 83/509, 88, 89, 90, 81/532, 88/1, 89/2, 79/530, 80/531, 83/529, 84, 85/1, 89/1, 90/1 Village Durgapur, Tehsil Sanganer, Jaipur.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in IHS and is 3992m from Rwy 27 of Jaipur Airport. The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 511.25m vide their letter dated 07.4.2014 against which they were granted 429.96m vide AAI letter dated 21.4.2014.

Aeronautical Study was conducted by AAI for 511.25m AMSL on the instruction of the Appellate Committee.

The report of Aeronautical Study was taken up in the Appellate Committee meeting held on 30<sup>th</sup> July, 2015. Based on the decision, authorization letter was issued for

S. K. Rawat

h

the proposed 11 towers by AAI vide letter dated 19.08.2015 for permissible top elevation.

Applicant requested the Appellate Committee to review the revised site layout plan for higher permissible height and submitted Jaipur Development Authority letter dated 14.12.2015. They also requested for review of permissible height w.r.t. ADS-B criteria.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 23.03.2016 decided that the site elevation is to be verified by AAI and permissible top elevation for each of the 11 towers as indicated in the Aeronautical Study result, be checked whether ADS-B criteria as approved has been incorporated and thereafter re-submitted to the Appellate Committee.

Airport Director, Jaipur vide letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> June, 2016 has confirmed after verification that site elevation of the plots varies from 403 m to 404 m AMSL as per plots details submitted by the applicant.

The case was re-examined at AAI and the maximum permissible top elevation is summarized as per table given below:-

<b>Tower No.</b>	<b>Max PTE (mts AMSL)</b>
TOWER-1	466.2
TOWER-2	466.48
TOWER-3	466.91
TOWER-4	467.15
TOWER-5	467.42
TOWER-6	467.67
TOWER-7	468.3
TOWER-8	468.68
TOWER-9	469.02
TOWER-10	467.95
TOWER-11	467.46

This Committee examined the above table and observed that the maximum permissible top elevation (meters AMSL) as worked out by AAI for respective Towers 1 to 11 is the minimum of the maximum heights obtained for the following parameters, i.e., AGA, CNS and PANS-OPS. The Committee also noted that since the ADS-B is not yet notified, therefore, the said criteria in determining the height is not applied.

**Committees' Decision:**

**The maximum permissible top elevation for the Towers No. 1 to 11 as indicated in the table above is authorized.**

2. **Shri Jai Ram More, C/o Shri Y.E Rafik, Mumbai.**

**Case No.:** MUM/14/NOCAS/400  
**CHQ File No.:** AAI/20012/26/2015  
**NOCAS ID:** JUHU/WEST/B/080814/55402  
**Site Address:** CTS No.1(Pt) of Village Oshivara Andheri (W) Oshivara, Mumbai

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Conical Surface** and is 895m from IHS of Juhu Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 161.28m AMSL vide their letter dated 21.8.2014 against which they were granted 122.59m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 07.10.2014. Subsequently, the applicant requested for a revised height of 149m AMSL vide their letter dated 11.3.2015.

The Appellate Committee in its meeting on 27.8.2015 approved the conduct of an Aeronautical Study for a height of 148.25m AMSL.

The Aeronautical Study report was examined in the Appellate Committee of 23.03.2016 wherein it was observed that the permissible top elevation is 118m AMSL being restricted from IAL consideration. The Appellate Committee also noted that the height granted by AAI initially on 7.10.2014 was 122.59m AMSL. The Committee further noted that the permissible height from AGA and CNS parameters is higher than the original granted height of 122.59m AMSL. The committee was informed by AAI that the permissible top elevation is restricted to 118m AMSL on application of proposed PBN procedures for Runway 14. The Appellate Committee opined that the matter needs to be examined from the legal point of view as the permissible top elevation from the Aeronautical Study report, has been arrived from application of a procedure which is at the draft stage and awaiting DGCA approval, and also the height derived from such a procedure is less than the height granted initially by AAI in October, 2014. The Committee also noted that the PBN procedure referred to in the Aeronautical Study is under development and will be published after DGCA approval. The Committee directed that as the matter is legal, opinion of Ministry of Law and Justice be obtained as to whether the earlier granted height 122.59m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 07.10.2014 will prevail or the height, arrived at by Aeronautical Study, be restricted to 118m AMSL. The Aeronautical Study report along with legal opinion to be re-submitted to the Appellate Committee.

Based on the Committee's decision, AAI through MoCA took up the matter with the Ministry of Law and Justice who have in their response dated 14.06.2016 stated that "as per legal opinion that height permission which was granted to the applicant would prevail and proposed procedures (which have not yet published) being prospective in nature would not affect the earlier permission/NOCs".

2

S.K. Raman

This Committee took note of the above legal opinion dated 14.06.2016, received from the Ministry of Law and Justice and advised AAI to review the OCA of RNAV Procedures.

**Committees' Decision:**

Based on the opinion of the Ministry of Law and Justice, AAI to issue the NOC for permissible top elevation of 122.59 m AMSL as granted earlier.



(A.K. Dutta)  
MEMBER (ANS), AAI



(J.S. Rawat)  
JOINT DGCA



(K. GOHAIN)  
TECHNICAL EXPERT



(ARUN KUMAR)  
JT. SECY, MOCA  
CHAIRMAN, APPELLATE COMMITTEE

Place: New Delhi

Date: August, 2016