

Ministry of Civil Aviation
Rajiv Gandhi Bhawan, New Delhi-110003

Minutes of the Meeting of the Appellate Committee held on
27th November, 2013

Reference Ministry of Civil Aviation letter No. AV.20036/66/2000-AAI dated 15-10-2012 read with letters dated 31-12-2012 and dated 04-01-2013, the Appellate Committee constituted to consider appeal/grievance made by different applicants with regard to the height allocated to them by AAI for their construction vis-à-vis the height sought by them, held its meeting under the Chairmanship of Joint Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation (MOCA) on 27th November, 2013.

The following Committee members were present:-

1. Sh. V. Somasundaram - Member (ANS), AAI
2. Sh. J.S.Rawat - Jt. DGCA
3. Sh. K. Gohain - Technical Expert

The Committee was assisted by Shri V.K. Dutta, ED (ATM) and Sh. A.K. Bhardwaj, GM (ATM-NOC) of Airports Authority of India (AAI).

The following decisions were taken for the Appeal cases that were brought up in this Committee Meeting:

AERONAUTICAL STUDY CASES

✓ 1. M/s Wadhwa Residency Pvt. Ltd.

Case No.: MUM/10/365
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/149/2010-ARI(NOC)
Site Address: CTS No. 50(Pt.), 50/1, 50/2(Pt.), Sector No.II of Village Vikhroli at L.B.S Marg Ghatkopar (West).

The proposed site is about 4040 m from Runway 27 and lies in conical surface of Rwy 27 of Santa Cruz. The applicant had initially requested a height of 134.81 m AMSL vide their letter dated 28.05.10 against which they were granted 87.50 m AMSL after conducting Aeronautical Study vide AAI letter dated 24.09.2012. The applicant in his letter dated 20.12.2012 requested a height of 109 m AMSL.

The case was last heard the meeting of 24-09-2013 wherein the Committee suggested that in view of the applicant's contention another AS may be conducted by agency other than AAI.

The applicant in this meeting submitted Aeronautical Study conducted by M/s To 70 Aviation (Australia) Pty. Ltd., Australia. The study report was presented by that agency and in a detailed discussion certain issues were brought out by the Committee which were not clarified in the study report / presentation such as ILS 3 Degree angle, confirmation of the site coordinates, vertical difference between OAS and ILS and its impact on the conclusions, etc.

The applicant subsequently submitted final report of Aeronautical Study to the Committee addressing the above mentioned issues which were taken into consideration by the Committee. The Committee is of the opinion that the earlier decision of GRC regarding Y-Surface (Transitional) of ILS procedure is not in accordance with the criteria laid down in ICAO Doc 8168. The AS report now submitted clarify that the Doc 8168 provisions have been considered in arriving at above decision.

Committees' Decision: Based on the discussions in the Committee meeting the final study report as submitted by the applicant was accepted by the Committee. The applicant may be informed the permitted height of 109 m AMSL through issue of NOC.

✓ **2. M/s Wadhwa Residency Pvt. Ltd.**

Case No.: MUM/10/362
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/147/2010-ARI(NOC)
Site Address: CTS No. 50(Pt.), 50/2(Pt.), 50/3, 50/4, 50/5(Pt.), 50/7(Pt.), Sector No.III of Village Vikhroli at L.B.S Marg Ghatkopar (West).

The proposed site is about 4048 m from Runway 27 and lies in conical surface of Santa Cruz Airport. The applicant had initially requested a height of 132.97 m AMSL vide their letter dated 28.05.10 against which they were granted 87.50 m AMSL vide letter dated 24.09.2012. The applicant in his letter dated 20.12.2012 requested a height of 109 m AMSL.

The case was last heard the Appellate Committee meeting of 24-09-2013 wherein the Committee suggested that in view of the applicant's contention another Aeronautical Study may be conducted by agency other than AAI.

The applicant in this meeting submitted Aeronautical Study conducted by M/s To 70 Aviation (Australia) Pty. Ltd., Australia. The study report was presented by that agency and in a detailed discussion certain issues were brought out by the Committee which were not clarified in the study report / presentation such as ILS 3 Degree angle, confirmation of the site coordinates, vertical difference between OAS and ILS and its impact on the conclusions, etc.

The applicant subsequently submitted final report of Aeronautical Study to the Committee addressing the above mentioned issues which were taken into consideration by the Committee. The Committee is of the opinion that the earlier decision of GRC regarding Y-Surface (Transitional) of ILS procedure is not in accordance with the criteria laid down in ICAO Doc 8168. The AS report now submitted clarify that the Doc 8168 provisions have been considered in arriving at above decision.

Committees' Decision: Based on the discussions in the Committee meeting the final study report as submitted by the applicant was accepted by the Committee. The applicant may be informed the permitted height of 109 m AMSL through issue of NOC.

Aswaha



✓ 3. M/s Reliance Industries, Mumbai.

CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/453/2006-ARI(NOC)
Site Address: Plot No. C-64, Village Bandra (East), Bandra-Kurla Complex,
Mumbai.

The Committee took up the case pertaining to M/s Reliance Industries to determine the status of the study from PAN-OPS criteria. The case was discussed in the earlier Committee meeting of 24th September, 2013 & 11th Oct. 2013 and as decided therein the CNS and PAN-OPS examination was carried out in AAI. For study purpose the plot was divided into 8 blocks and the permissible height for these blocks was calculated as per the coordinates of these blocks. The possible heights admissible on the various segments on their plot as marked by the applicant on the 24th September, 2013 was assessed and the approximate heights in individual segments admissible individually from both CNS and PAN-OPS was determined in the above studies.

The Committee took note of the heights permitted during examination by AAI of IAL and CNS parameters for the various 8 plot segments as identified by the applicant on 24th Sept. 2013. The Committee also observed that the applicant was informed in the earlier meeting to complete all formalities in this regard.

Committees' Decision: The applicant to be informed of the heights permissible in the various plot segments to be identified by coordinates of the specific segments of plot. NOC to be issued subject to submission of revised building section plan layout and undertaking.

✓ 4. Shri Atul N. Patel of M/s Atul Builders.

Case No.: MUM/09/103
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/04/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/WEST/B/083012/013
Site Address: CTS No. 17/2-A/1 of Village Vyaravali, Andheri (East),
Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in IHS of Santacruz Airport at a distance of 3185 m from Rwy end. The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 75.91m AMSL vide their letter dated 15.12.11 against which they were granted 69.00 m AMSL vide letter dated 23.04.10.

The Aeronautical Study ordered in the earlier AC meeting was submitted by AAI and the report does permit the height of 76.21 m AMSL. The committee took note of the observations of study report with regard to permissible height.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed the permitted height of 76.21 m AMSL through issue of NOC.

✓ 5. M/s DSK Real Estates Ltd., Kolkata

Case No.: ER/107/2008
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/1746/2008-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID.: BEHA/EAST/B/101112/027



Site Address: 34, D.H Road, Mouza-Durgapur, Ward No. 79, Borough -IX, Kolkata - 27.

The proposed site is in IHS of Behala airport and the applicant had requested for 160 m AMSL in their letter dated 22.08.2012. The Aeronautical Study was conducted by AAI as was decided in the earlier Appellate Committee meeting on the request filed by the applicant.

The Committee took note of the Aeronautical Study report which permits the height of 160 m AMSL at the site.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed the permitted height of 160 m AMSL through issue of NOC.

6. Sh. R.N. Pandey, Shripal Realty Pvt. Ltd. Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/10/643
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/16/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/EAST/B/082912/003
Site Address: CTS No. 182A/1, 182A/2, Village Tungve, Mumbai.

The site is about 3376 m from RWy 27 of Santacruz and is in the IHS. The height requested was 122.56 m AMSL against which they were granted a height of 56.27 m AMSL. On the appeal of the applicant Aeronautical Study was ordered in the earlier Appellate Committee meeting.

The report submitted by AAI after the Aeronautical Study as permitted a height of 102.01 m AMSL and not the requested height 122.56 m AMSL. The Committee took note of the Aeronautical Study report and observed that the height has been restricted due CNS parameters.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that Aeronautical Study report does not permit the requested height of 122.56 m AMSL. The maximum permissible height is 102.01 m AMSL.

✓ **7. M/s Pride Hill Developers Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai**

Case No.: MUM/11/20
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/90/2011-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID.: JUHU/WEST/B/081312/041
Site Address: CTS No. A/754, A/755 A & B and A/757 of Village Bandra (West) at Bandra (West), Mumbai.

The site is 4120 m from RWy 09 of Santacruz and lies in the conical surface. The applicant has earlier requested height of 185.2 m AMSL on 7-01-2011 which was revised to 113.90 m AMSL on 6th April, 2013.

An Aeronautical Study was conducted by AAI as decided in the earlier Appellate Committee meeting and the report submitted was examined. The committee

observed that the height permissible is 113.90 m AMSL as was requested by the applicant.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed the permitted height of 113.90 m AMSL through issue of NOC.

8. M/s D B MIG Realtors & Builders Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/10/652
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/75/2011-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/WEST/B/091412/005
Site Address: CTS No. 649 and 649/1 to 649/48 of Village Bandra(East) at Bandra(East), Mumbai.

The site is at 3440 m from Rwy 09 of Santacruz and lies in the IHS. The height requested by the applicant was 108.75 m AMSL on their online application dated 14.09.2012. The AAI had given a height of 56.27 m AMSL in their letter of 15th March, 2013.

The Aeronautical Study report submitted by AAI reveals that the plot has a number of buildings of which the maximum height permitted to one specific building is 108 m AMSL. The other buildings in the plot are permitted to a height of 85 m AMSL.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that their requested height of 108.75 m AMSL is not applicable on their site. The maximum permissible height of 108 m AMSL for one specific building be communicated with coordinates for that building.



(V.SOMASUNDARAM)
MEMBER (ANS)



(J. S. RAWAT)
JT. DGCA



(K.GOHAIN)
TECHNICAL EXPERT



(ALOK SINHA)
JT. SECY, MOCA
CHAIRMAN, APPELLATE COMMITTEE

Place: New Delhi
Date: 27th November, 2013

