

**Ministry of Civil Aviation**  
**Rajiv Gandhi Bhawan, New Delhi-110003**

**Minutes of the Meeting of the Appellate Committee held on**  
**26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014**

Reference Ministry of Civil Aviation letter No. AV.20036/66/2000-AAI dated 15-10-2012 read with letters dated 31-12-2012 and dated 04-01-2013, the Appellate Committee constituted to consider appeal/grievance made by different applicants with regard to the height allocated to them by AAI for their construction vis-à-vis the height sought by them, held its meeting under the Chairmanship of Joint Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation (MOCA) on 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014.

The following Committee members were present:-

- |    |                     |   |                   |
|----|---------------------|---|-------------------|
| 1. | Sh. V. Somasundaram | - | Member (ANS), AAI |
| 2. | Sh. J.S. Rawat      | - | Jt. DGCA          |
| 2. | Sh. K. Gohain       | - | Technical Expert  |

The Committee was assisted by Sh. A.K. Dutta, Executive Director(ATM) and Sh. A.K. Bhardwaj, GM (ATM-NOC) of Airports Authority of India (AAI).

The following decisions were taken on the Aeronautical Study reports submitted in this Committee Meeting:

**AERONAUTICAL STUDY CASES**

**1. M/s H.J Thakur Architects Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai.**

Case No.	MUM/12/NOCAS/050
File No.	AAI/20012/29/2013-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID:	SNCR/WEST/B/070512/003
Site Address:	CTS No. 189-A,189-B,189-C,190A(Pt),190A/1 to 5, 190B, 191A, 191A/1 to 7, 191B, Village Tungwa at Saki Vihar Road, Kurla(West), M.S.D., Mumbai

The proposed site lies in the IHS and is 2998m from Rwy 27 end of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 97.30 m AMSL vide their letter dated 05.07.2012 against which they were granted a height of 56.28 AMSL vide letter dated 17.09.2012.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents, submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

*Asmita*

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the permissible height due to the proposed ASR at Kalina Gate which is awaiting operationalization will be 93.30 m AMSL. This height is also permitted from PAN-OPS criteria. The height permissible with respect existing ASR only is 96.93 m AMSL.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized 97.30 m AMSL as requested by them after the ASR at Kalina gate, Mumbai is operational. In the interim period the applicant be authorized a height of 96.93 m AMSL.

## 2. Shri D.P Jain, (M/s Square Consultants), Mumbai.

Case No. MUM/12/NOCAS/40  
File No. AAI/20012/123/2012-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/070312/006  
Site Address: C.T.S No. 1249Pt), 125(Pt), 1269pt) of Village Marol at military Road, Andheri (East), Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in IHS of Santa Cruz Airport at a distance of 3669m from Rwy 14 end.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 70 m AMSL vide their letter dated 14.07.2012 against which they were granted a height of 56.27 AMSL vide letter dated 13.09.2012. Subsequently applicant requested a revised height of 80 m AMSL vide letter dated 27.09.2012 which was further revised by the applicant to 77.71 m AMSL vide their letter dated 16.10.2013.

The case was discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the height last requested 77.71 m AMSL by the applicant is permissible from both CNS and PAN-OPS criteria.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized a height of 77.71 m AMSL. Authorisation for 77.71 m AMSL be issued.

## 3. M/s Joy Builders, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/09/587  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/145/2012-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID.: JUHU/WEST/B/102312/07

*Asurva*

**Site Address:** C.T.S. No. E/86/10 of Village Bandra (West) at 19<sup>th</sup> Road Khar (West), Mumbai

The proposed site lies in IHS and is 2690 m Rwy 09 end of Santa Cruz Airport. The applicant had initially requested a height of 67.30 m AMSL vide their letter dated 18.11.09 against which they were granted 56.27 m AMSL vide letter dated 26.02.2010. The applicant thereafter in his letter dated 23.09.2013 requested a height of 80 m AMSL.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the height requested by the applicant 80 m AMSL is permissible from both PAN-OPS and CNS criteria.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized a height of 80.00 m AMSL. Authorisation for 80.00 m AMSL be issued.

**4. Sh. Sandeep Gopal, Indian Oxygen Ltd, (Sh. R.V. Joshi – Architect), Mumbai.**

**Case No.:** MUM/09/498  
**CHQ File No.:** AAI/20012/41/2011-ARI(NOC)  
**NOCAS ID.:** SNCR/WEST/B/032113/021  
**Site Address:** CTS No. 168A/B(Pt.), and 178C/1(Pt.), Ghatkopar, Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in IHS at a distance of 3740m from Rwy 27 of Santa Cruz Airport. The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 83.90 m AMSL vide their letter dated 06.10.2009 against which they were granted 55.26 m AMSL vide letter dated 08.02.2010 and 70.16 m AMSL vide letter dated 30-06-2010 under Shielding Benefit. The applicant in its letter of 2502.2013 has reiterated for height of 83.90 m AMSL.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the height requested 83.90 m AMSL is permissible from both CNS and PAN-OPS criteria.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized a height of 83.90 m AMSL. Authorisation for 83.90 m AMSL be issued.

*Aruna*

5. M/s Charmee Nirman & M/s Salient Traders, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/10/679  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/143/2012  
NOCAS ID.: JUHU/WEST/B/081812/010  
Site Address: CTS No. 81/1 to 148, 81/188 of Village Gundavali, Mumbai.

The site is 2542 m from Rwy 14 end and is in the IHS of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 56 m AMSL vide their letter dated 28.10.2010 against which they were granted 56 m AMSL vide letter dated 25.02.2011. The applicant in its letter of 18.10.2012 has applied for revised height of 73.75 m AMSL.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 11<sup>th</sup> October, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the height requested 73.75 m AMSL is permissible from PAN-OPS and also from CNS with the proposed radar at Kalina gate which is being operationalised. The height permitted by the existing radar is however 72.51 m AMSL.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized 73.75 m AMSL as requested by them after the ASR at Kalina gate, Mumbai is operational. In the interim period the applicant be authorized a height of 72.51 m AMSL.

6. M/s S & CS Hotels Pvt. Ltd. Hyderabad.

Case No.: HY/128/2013  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/108/2013-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID.: HYDE/SOUTH/B/050113/028  
Site Address: Plot bearing Municipal No. 8-2-293/80/1 in T.S No. 6/1/P & 6/1/2 part Block-E, Ward No. 10 in Survey No. 403 part, Shaiket Village, Hyderabad.

The proposed site lies in conical surface of Hyderabad Airport at a distance of 4391 from Rwy 09. The applicant had earlier applied online for a height of 652.85 m AMSL vide their letter dated 01.05.13 against which the height was rejected vide AAI letter dated 26.11.12. The applicant in its letter dated 04.07.13 has reiterated for height of 652.85 m AMSL.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

*Abhinav*

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the height requested is permissible from both PAN-OPS and CNS criteria.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized a height of 652.85 m AMSL. Authorisation for 652.85 m AMSL be issued.

#### 7. M/s Gammon India Ltd., Mumbai.

**Case No.:** MUM/11/107  
**CHQ File No.:** AAI/20012/23/2012-ARI(NOC)  
**NOCAS ID:** JUHU/SOUTH/B/110912/016  
**Site Address:** CTS No. 844/22, 844/26, 844/31, 844/32 of village Ambivalli at Andheri(West), Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in Conical Surface and is at a distance of 4280 m AMSL from Rwy 14 extremity of Santacruz Airport. The applicant had initially requested a height of 169.750 m AMSL online dated 11.02.2011 against which they were granted a height of 70.27 m AMSL vide letter dated 04.07.2011. The applicant in its letter dated Nil has requested for height of 194.75 m AMSL.

The Case was heard in AC meeting held on 24<sup>th</sup> September, 2013 wherein an Aeronautical Study was ordered. After carrying out Aero Study by AAI, authorization for maximum permissible top elevation of 65.90 m AMSL at the location was issued to the applicant.

The applicant in the meeting of 30<sup>th</sup> January, 2014 appealed that the Aeronautical Study report needs to be reexamined as the height granted 65.9 m AMSL was due restriction from GP inoperative procedures which is not applicable in their case. The Committee ordered that the Aeronautical Study report be reexamined at AAI.

This meeting considered the reexamination of the Aeronautical Study report which was with respect to primary and secondary basic ILS surfaces. The IAL expert of AAI was also called in to clarify the findings of the reexamination. After detailed deliberations it was observed by the Committee that the permissible height is restricted due RNAV(GNSS) Procedure, RNP 0.3(Baronav Procedure Rwy 14) which have already been notified and is awaiting implementation. The Committee was further informed that for all Aeronautical Studies at Mumbai airport the examination under the PAN-OPS IAL criteria takes into account the notified ARNAV procedures. The permissible height is for the instant case is 82.1 m AMSL.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized the permissible 82.1 m AMSL. Authorisation for 82.1 m AMSL be issued.

*Aswika*

8. The Dy. Commissioner of Police, Land and Building Cell, Delhi Police, New Delhi.

Case No.: NR/2013/193  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/99/2013-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID.: SAFD/NORTH/B/041613/009  
Site Address: Parliament Street, New Delhi.

The proposed site lies in conical surface of Safdarjung Airport and OHS of IGI Airport at a distance of 177.36 m from IHS of Safdarjung Airport and 11545 from ARP of IGI Airport. The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 286.55 m AMSL vide their letter dated 16.04.13 against which they were granted 268.868 m AMSL vide letter dated 17.05.13. The applicant in its letter dated 20.06.13 has reiterated for height of 286.55 m AMSL.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> December, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the height requested 286.55 m AMSL is permissible from both PAN-OPS and CNS criteria.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized a height of 286.55m AMSL. Authorisation for 286.55 m AMSL be issued.

9. Shri Rajesh M. Patil, M/s Siddharth Constructions, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/2011/202  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/116/2012-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/WEST/B/080812/013  
Site Address: CTS No.619 of Village, Bandra(East), at Bandra(East), Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in IHS of Santa Cruz Airport at a distance of 2209 m Rwy 09. The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 80.35 m AMSL vide their letter dated 22.03.2011 against which they were granted 56.27m AMSL vide letter dated 14.11.2011. The applicant in its letter dated 25.03.13 has applied for revised higher height of 113.75 m AMSL and thereafter in their letter dated 25.11.2013 has applied for new revised reduced height of 94 m AMSL.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the last height requested ie. 94 m AMSL is not admissible. However, the Aeronautical Study report has indicated that the height permissible as restricted by the present ASR is 69.14 m AMSL. The height permissible due to the proposed ASR at Kalina Gate, Mumbai is however 55.65 m AMSL. The Committee also took note that with the integration of the radars, in a multi-radar environment at Mumbai the maximum height permissible from individual radar will be admissible.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant may be informed that his requested height of 94 m AMSL is not admissible and that a height of 69.14 m AMSL is only permissible at his location. Authorisation for 69.14 m AMSL be issued.

#### 10. M/s Sky Link Developers, M/s Space Design Consultants, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/09/457  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/95/2013-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/WEST/B/040613/004  
Site Address: CTS No. 77A, 77A/1 to 49 of Village Saki, Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in IHS and is 2459 m from Rwy 27 of Santa Cruz Airport. The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 64.09 m AMSL on 14.09.2009 against which they were granted 56.27 m AMSL vide letter dated 10.03.2010. Subsequently the applicant revised their height requirement to 79.99 m AMSL vide letter dated 20.05.2013.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> December, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the height requested is 79.99 m AMSL is permissible from both PAN-OPS and CNS criteria.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized a height of 79.99 m AMSL. Authorisation for 79.99 m AMSL be issued.

#### 11. Mr. Aatif J. Merchant, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/09/416  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/191/2010-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID.: JUHU/WEST/B/082212/004  
Site Address: CTS No.F.879, F.P. No.18 of Village Bandra, T.PS.III, Bandra (West), Mumbai.

*Asurhai*

The proposed site lies in IHS at a distance of 3645m from Rwy 09 of Santa Cruz Airport. The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 80.82 m AMSL vide their letter dated 16.10.2009 against which they were granted 56.27 m AMSL vide letter dated 14.12.2009. The applicant in his subsequent letters dated 12.12.2010 and 29.08.13 has applied for revised height of 64.37 m AMSL.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014. The Committee was informed that the applicant had subsequently clarified that his request for height is 63.40 m AMSL as had been recommended by the MCGM in their support letter dated 17.08.2013. The Committee taking into account the height requested as 63.40 m AMSL noted that the said height is permissible from both PAN-OPS and CNS criteria.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized a height of 63.40 m AMSL. Authorisation for 63.40 m AMSL be issued.

#### **12. M/s Acme Realities Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai.**

**Case No.:** MUM/13/NOCAS/111  
**CHQ File No.:** AAI/20012/117/2013-ARI(NOC)  
**NOCAS ID.:** SNCR/WEST/B/020713/024  
**Site Address:** CTS No.160A/1(Pt.), 162(Pt.), 163(Pt.), 170(Pt.), 170G, 165(Pt.),  
Village Majas, Jogeshwari, Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in IHS and is 3869 m from Rwy 14 of Santa Cruz Airport. The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 137.985 m AMSL on 28.03.2013 against which they were granted 56.895m AMSL vide letter dated 30.07.2013. The applicant had revised their height requirement to 140 m AMSL vide letter dated 26.07.2013 with the request for Aeronautical Study.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> December, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the height last requested 140 m AMSL is not admissible as from CNS criteria. The maximum height permissible from CNS criteria is 136.958 m AMSL due to the proposed ASR at Kalina Gate and that the height permissible with the existing ASR is restricted to 117.73 m AMSL. The report has also

*Asunta*



indicated that the height requested 140 m AMSL penetrates the ILS localizer 14 radiation surface and is restricted to 124.14 m AMSL.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant be informed that the height requested by him 140 m AMSL is not admissible. However, he may be informed that at present he may be authorized 117.73 m AMSL and later with the operationalisation of the Kalina Gate radar the permissible height would be 136.95 m AMSL. Authorisation for 117.73 m AMSL be issued as interim measures.

### 13. M/s Manish Vijay Enterprises (Sh. Yomesh Rao), Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/060  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/44/2010-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/WEST/B/070312/022  
Site Address: CTS 394 & 395 of Village Mogra at Andheri(E), Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in IHS at a distance of 3063 m from Rwy 14 of Santa Cruz Airport. The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 128.10 m AMSL vide their letter dated 05.07.2012 against which they were granted 56.28 m AMSL vide letter dated 03.10.2012. The applicant in his subsequent letter dated 14.01.2013 has reiterated requirement of height of 128.10 m AMSL. The applicant thereafter revised his height requirement to 70 m AMSL vide their letter dated 26.12.2013 with the request for Aeronautical Study.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study, had ordered the Aeronautical study.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 and the committee noted that the height last requested 70 m AMSL is permissible from both PAN-OPS and CNS criteria.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant is authorized a height of 70 m AMSL. Authorisation for 70 m AMSL be issued.

### OTHER CASES

#### 1. M/s L&T Seawoods Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/618  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/160/2012-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID.: NAVI/WEST/B/091112/011  
Site Address: Unit-B, Plot No. R-1, Sector-40, Nerul, Navi Mumbai.

*Asunha*

The proposed site lies in the IHS being 3864 m from Rwy 08 of Navi Mumbai Airport. The applicant had requested for a height of 158.10 m AMSL in their letter dated 17.09.2012 against which they were granted height of 53 m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 20.12.2012. Subsequently the applicant had revised their height requirement to 125.30 m AMSL in their letter dated 21.05.2013.

The case was earlier heard in the AC meeting 27.11.2013 wherein as per decisions taken a meeting was taken on 17.02.2014 with CIDCO authorities to discuss the policy adopted by them in leasing land around the proposed Navi Mumbai Airport, which is also a CIDCO project, and the steps taken by them to protect the air space around the airport while leasing land for construction of high rise buildings. In the same meeting CIDCO representative informed that at the time of sale of the plot to L&T Seawoods they were conveyed that only 50 m height is permissible.

In today's meeting the applicant stated that their project involves a construction of a Railway station, Seawood to be handed over free of cost to the railways. It was also informed that according to local regulations of Navi Mumbai Municipal Authorities they have to offer setback of nearly 30% to 35% of their land for development purposes besides another 10% to 12% for railway electrification, overbridge, etc. The applicant had submitted a letter from CIDCO dated 4.03.2014 in which they had recommended a height upto 92 m AMSL only.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant to submit details indicating total land allotted, land utilized for railway station purposes to be given free, total setbacks of area as per requirement of local authorities and area available for construction of commercial/sale buildings.

## 2. M/s L&T Seawoods Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/NM/171  
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/161/2012-ARI(NOC)  
NOCAS ID.: NAVI/WEST/B/061812/005  
Site Address: Unit-B, Plot No. R-1, Sector-40, Nerul, Navi Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in the conical surface at 4034 m from Rwy 08 of Navi Mumbai Airport. The applicant had requested for a height of 158.10 m AMSL in their letter dated 29.06.2012 against which they were granted height of 54.72m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 27.09.2012. Subsequently the applicant had revised their height requirement to 125.30 m AMSL in their letter dated 21.05.2013.

The case was earlier heard in the AC meeting 27.11.2013 wherein as per decisions taken a meeting was taken on 17.02.2014 with CIDCO authorities to discuss the policy adopted by them in leasing land around the proposed Navi Mumbai Airport, which is

*Asin*

also a CIDCO project, and the steps taken by them to protect the air space around the airport while leasing land for construction of high rise buildings. In the same meeting CIDCO representative informed that at the time of sale of the plot to L&T Seawoods they were conveyed that only 50 m height is permissible.


In today's meeting the applicant stated that their project involves a construction of a Railway station, Seawood to be handed over free of cost to the railways. It was also informed that according to local regulations of Navi Mumbai Municipal Authorities they have to offer setback of nearly 30% to 35% of their land for development purposes besides another 10% to 12% for railway electrification, overbridge, etc. The applicant had submitted a letter from CIDCO dated 4.03.2014 in which they had recommended a height upto 92 m AMSL only.

**Committees' Decision:** The applicant to submit details indicating total land allotted, land utilized for railway station purposes to be given free, total setbacks of area as per requirement of local authorities and area available for construction of commercial/sale buildings.

  
(V.SOMASUNDARAM)  
MEMBER (ANS)

  
(J.S.RAWAT)  
JT. DGCA

  
(K.GOHAIN)  
TECHNICAL EXPERT

  
(ALOK SINHA)  
JT. SECY, MOCA  
CHAIRMAN, APPELLATE COMMITTEE

Place: New Delhi  
Date: 26<sup>th</sup> March, 2014