

Ministry of Civil Aviation
Rajiv Gandhi Bhawan, New Delhi-110003

Minutes of the Meeting of the Appellate Committee held on
7th February, 2014

Reference Ministry of Civil Aviation letter No. AV.20036/66/2000-AAI dated 15-10-2012 read with letters dated 31-12-2012 and dated 04-01-2013, the Appellate Committee constituted to consider appeal/grievance made by different applicants with regard to the height allocated to them by AAI for their construction vis-à-vis the height sought by them, held its meeting under the Chairmanship of Joint Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation (MOCA) on 7th February, 2014.

The following Committee members were present:-

1. Sh. V. Somasundaram - Member (ANS), AAI
2. Sh. K. Gohain - Technical Expert

The Committee was assisted by Sh. A.K. Bhardwaj, GM (ATM-NOC) of Airports Authority of India (AAI).

The following decisions were taken on the Aeronautical Study reports submitted in this Committee Meeting:

AERONAUTICAL STUDY CASES

1. M/s Catapult Realty Consultants, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/022
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/04/2013-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/022012/005
Site Address: CTS No. 126, Village-Chembur, Mumbai.

The site lies in IHS and is about 3031m from Rwy 32 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 129.65 m AMSL vide their letter dated 21.06.2012 against which they were granted a height of 56.28 AMSL vide letter dated 16.11.2012.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting on 16.08.2013 followed by the meeting of 24th August, 2013 and 24th September, 2013. The Committee after examining the documents submitted by the applicant in support of their request for Aeronautical Study had sanctioned the study in its meeting of 24th September, 2013.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting of 7th February, 2014 and the committee noted that the maximum permissible height at the

Asin

site is restricted by CNS criteria to 106.78 m AMSL and that the height requested by the applicant at 129.65 m AMSL is not admissible.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that the height requested 129.65 m AMSL is not admissible at the site. Authorisation for 106.78 m AMSL be issued to NOC issuing authority for their reference.

2. M/s Spenta Housing Corporation, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/11/288
File No.: AAI/20012/114/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR /WEST/B/012613/001
Site Address: CTS No.343 (Pt.) Village Chembur, Mumbai.

The site lies in IHS at a distance of 3176 m AMSL from Rwy 32 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially been granted a height of 56.27 m AMSL by AAI in their letter dated 08.11.2011. Subsequently the applicant in an appeal requested for a revised height of 90 m AMSL vide their letter dated 26.07.2012.

The case was earlier heard in Appellate Committee Meeting 19th August, 2013 wherein the applicant was required to submit the necessary documents in support of their request. Subsequently in the meeting of 24th September, 2013, the applicant submitted the letter from the SRA, Mumbai justifying height of 100 m AMSL. The applicant clarified that their request is for 90 m AMSL on which the Committee directed an Aeronautical Study to be conducted whether the height of 90 m AMSL is admissible or not.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this Committee meeting and it has been noted that the height 90 m AMSL as sought by the applicant is admissible at the site.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that the height of 90 m AMSL as sought by them is admissible at the site. Authorisation of 90 m AMSL be issued to NOC issuing authority for their reference.

3. M/s Wilfred Pereira & Co., Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/11/64
File No.: AAI/20012/45/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/012813/009
Site Address: CTS No. C/1356 of Village Bandra(W), Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 3154m away from Rwy 09 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially been granted a height of 56.27 m AMSL by AAI in the letter of 15.2.2012 against their request of 108.435 m AMSL in 24.01.2011. However the applicant subsequently had requested in their appeal a height of 108.435 m AMSL vide their letter dated 30.03.2012.

Aranta

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting of 24th September, 2013 wherein the Committee considered the presentation including an approval letter from MCGM for a height of 70 m AGL(S.E. 37.535 m AMSL). The applicant had requested in that meeting for conduct of Aeronautical Study. The Committee taking note of documents submitted and the request of the applicant for Aeronautical Study had sanctioned the Aeronautical Study to determine whether the height of 108.435 m AMSL is permissible at that site.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this Committee meeting and it has been noted that the building plan submitted includes two separate buildings Wing-A and Wing-B at that site. The Aeronautical Study report further indicates that the maximum permissible height of 108.435 m AMSL as sought by the applicant is admissible at the site only for the specific building Wing-A (Coordinates of building specified) and that the building Wing-B whose coordinates are also specified is restricted to a maximum permissible height of 94 m AMSL (CNS Criteria).

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that 108.435 m AMSL as sought by them is admissible for Wing-A building, the coordinates of the extremities as contained in the building plan and that the said height 108.435 m AMSL is not admissible for Wing-B building. Authorisation for 108.435 m AMSL for Wing-A building and for 94 m AMSL for Wing-B building be issued to NOC issuing authority for their reference.

4. M/s Lucky Hospitality, M/s Prim Sagar Premises, Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/10/633
File No.: AAI/20012/37/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/080312/019
Site Address: CTS No. F/6 of Village Bandra (West) F.P. No. 333 & 334 of
TPS-II of Bandra at Bandra (West), Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 2989m away from Rwy 09 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially been granted a height of 56.27 m AMSL by AAI in the letter of 21.03.2011 against their request of 70.35 m AMSL on 01.01.2010. Subsequently the applicant had requested a height of 72.175 m AMSL in their letter dated 21.08.2012.

The case was earlier heard in Appellate Committee Meeting 19th August, 2013 wherein the Committee after examining the support letter from State Authorities for the project had ordered an Aeronautical Study to determine whether height of 72.175 m AMSL sought by the applicant is admissible or not.

Asinba

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this Committee meeting and it has been noted that the height of 72.175 m AMSL as sought by the applicant is permissible from both IAL and CNS criteria.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that the height 72.175 m AMSL as sought by them is admissible at that site. Authorisation for 72.175 m AMSL be issued.

5. M/s L&T Realty Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/NOCAS/025/12
File No.: AAI/20012/111/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/062112/002
Site Address: CTS No. 117B of Village Tungwa, Taluka Kurla, Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 3884 m away from Rwy 27 end of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 126.65 m AMSL in their letter dated 29.06.2012 against which they were granted a height of 56.28 AMSL vide letter dated 22.08.2012. Subsequently the applicant in their letter 8th May, 2013 had appealed for a revised height of 136 m AMSL.

The case was earlier discussed in the AC meeting of 16th August, 2013 followed by the meeting of 24th August, 2013. After the applicant had submitted the required documents in support of their project from the State Authorities, the Committee in its meeting of 24th September, 2013 ordered an Aeronautical Study to determine whether the height of 136 m AMSL is admissible or not.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this Committee meeting and it has been noted that the request is for two towers at that site having specified coordinates for its extremities. According to the Aeronautical Study report, the maximum permissible height for both the towers with specified coordinates for its extremities is restricted from CNS criteria as 126.67 m AMSL for Tower – 1 and 124.74 m AMSL for Tower-2. The height sought by the applicant 136 m AMSL is however not admissible.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that the height sought by them as 136 m AMSL is not admissible at that site. Authorisation for permissible height of 126.67 m AMSL for Tower-1 and 124.74 m AMSL for Tower-2 be issued to NOC issuing authority for their reference.

6. M/s Foremost Realtors Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/10/594
File No.: AAI/20012/74/2011-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/020613/013

Asmita

Site Address: CTS No. 7643(pt), 7643/1, 7643/2(pt), 7643/3(pt), 7716 & 4207(pt) of Kolekalyan, Bandra (East), Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 2667 m away from Rwy 09 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 76.75 m AMSL in their letter dated 13.09.2010 against which they were granted a height of 56.27 m AMSL. The applicant subsequently appealed for a revised height of 113.95 m AMSL vide their letter dated 12.06.2013.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting of 24th September, 2013 wherein based on the presentation and documents submitted the Committee sanctioned the Aeronautical Study be conducted to determine whether height sought by applicant 113.95 m AMSL is admissible or not.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this Committee meeting and it has been noted that the building plan is for two buildings, Building-A and Building-B whose coordinates for the extremities of building are specified. According to the Aeronautical Study report, the maximum permissible height for both buildings with specified coordinates for its extremities is restricted from CNS criteria as 87.60 m AMSL for Building-A and 66.40 m AMSL for Building-B. The height sought by the applicant 113.95 m AMSL is however not admissible for both buildings.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that the height sought by them as 113.95 m AMSL is not admissible at that site. Authorisation for 87.60 m AMSL for Wing-A and 66.4 m AMSL for Wing-B be issued to NOC issuing authority for their reference.

7. M/s Lokhandwala Kataria Constructions Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/10/512
File No.: AAI/20012/56/2011-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/082912/001
Site Address: CS No.1(Pt) & 2(Pt) of Lower Parel Div. at J.R. Boricha Marg in G/South Ward, Mumbai.

The site lies in OHS and is at about 12163 from ARP of Santacruz Airport and 12146 from ARP of Juhu Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 311.503 m AMSL against which they were granted a height of 202.99 m AMSL vide letter dated 17th January, 2011.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting of 19th August, 2013 wherein it was decided that an Aeronautical Study be conducted to determine the height permissible.

Aruna

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this Committee Meeting and the Committee noted that the height sought 311.503 m AMSL is admissible for the single building on that site, whose coordinates for the extremities are specified.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that the height sought 311.503 m AMSL is admissible for a single building the coordinates of its extremities are specified as in the plan submitted.

8. M/s Nuzen Herbal Pvt. Ltd. Hyderabad

Case No.: HY/232/2012
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/158/2012-ARI (NOC)
NOCAS ID.: HYDE/SOUTH/B/110112/008
Site Address: Office Building on Municipal House No. 8-2-293/82/A/92 & 8-2-293/A/92/1 on Plot No. 92 in Survey No. 403/1, Shaikpet Village, Hyderabad.

The site lies at 4665 m from Rwy 09 end of Hyderabad Airport(Begumpet) and is in the conical surface.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 625 m AMSL online against which they were granted a height of 602.30 AMSL vide letter dated 23.11.2012. Subsequently the applicant had appealed on 15.02.2013 for a height of 617 m AMSL.

The case was earlier heard the Committee meeting of 16th August, 2013 wherein the applicant had quoted other buildings in their neighborhood of height 593/596 m AMSL. The applicant in their presentation has requested for Aeronautical Study stating that they require the height as per international standards for camera shooting activities for their news channel.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this Committee meeting and it is noted that the height 617 m AMSL is admissible both from IAL and CNS criteria.

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that the height sought 617 m AMSL is admissible at that site.

9. M/s Grih Rachna, Mr. Tushar S. Parulekar, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/016
File No.: AAI/20012/126/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/WEST/B/052612/007
Site Address: CTS No. 706, 706/1 to 10 of Village Marol Andheri(East), Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 2019 m away from Rwy 14 of Santacruz Airport.

Aswaha

The applicant had initially requested a height of 86 m AMSL vide their letter dated 26.05.2012 against which they were granted a height of 56.27 AMSL vide letter dated 08.08.2012.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting of 19th August, 2013 followed by meeting of 24th August, 2013. In the subsequent meeting of 24th September, 2013 the applicant submitted the requisite letters from the SRA, Mumbai justifying the project height of 86 m AMSL as requested by the applicant. The Committee then sanctioned an Aeronautical Study to determine whether the height requested 86 m AMSL is admissible or not at that site.

The Aeronautical Study report since received was examined in this meeting and it was noted that the maximum permissible height is restricted by CNS criteria to **71.336 m AMSL in case of present ASR and 75.35 m AMSL in case of proposed ASR.**

Committees' Decision: The applicant be informed that the height of 86 m AMSL as sought by them is not admissible at that site. Authorisation for height of 75.35 m AMSL be issued to NOC issuing authority after the proposed ASR at Kalina is operational and till such time NOC for height of 71.336 m AMSL be issued.

10. M/s GVK MIAL, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/MIAL/015
File No.: AAI/20012/136/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/070712/009
Site Address: Santacruz Airport, Mumbai.

The proposed site lies in the transitional surface and is 393 m away from Rwy 14 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 51 m AMSL vide their letter dated 09.07.2012 against which authorization were issued for points A-29.79 m AMSL, B-30.59 m AMSL, C-31.40 m AMSL, D-30.61 m AMSL, E-30.57 m AMSL and F-30.69 m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 14.09.2012(NOC not issued). Appellate Committee, in their meeting held on 09.01.2013, issued directives to carry out CNS simulation study.

After the simulation study conducted by AAI, following are the permissible heights according to AGA, IAL and CNS with conditions:

AGA-45.86 m AMSL, IAL-51 m AMSL and CNS-45 m AMSL.

The proposed structure may be permitted for top elevation 45 m AMSL subject to following conditions:

Asmita

- a) These are confined to the specified coordinates
- b) The exterior is made of glass (non-metallic)
- c) As the structures are within the operational area and may affect the future expansion of CNS facilities, in that case, applicant shall provide suitable space & shall bear the cost of trans-installation/relocation expenses.

Committees' Decision: The proposed structure may be permitted for Top Elevation of 45 m AMSL with the specified CNS conditions.

11. M/s GVK MIAL, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/MIAL/014
File No.: AAI/20012/141/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/070712/007
Site Address: Santacruz Airport, Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 546m away from Rwy 14 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 50.65 m AMSL vide their letter dated 09.07.2012 against which authorization were issued for points A-28.58 m AMSL, B-29.43 m AMSL, C-30.22 m AMSL, D-29.40 m AMSL, E-29.38 m AMSL and F-29.51 m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 14.09.2012(NOC not issued). Appellate Committee, in their meeting held on 09.01.2013, issued directives to carry out CNS simulation study.

After the simulation study conducted by AAI, following are the permissible heights according to AGA, IAL and CNS with conditions:

AGA-56.9 m AMSL, IAL-50.65 m AMSL and CNS-45 m AMSL.

The proposed structure may be permitted for top elevation 45 m AMSL subject to following conditions:

- a) These are confined to the specified coordinates.
- b) The exterior is made of glass (non-metallic).
- c) As the structures are within the operational area and may affect the future expansion of CNS facilities, in that case, applicant shall provide suitable space & shall bear the cost of trans-installation/relocation expenses.

Committees' Decision: The proposed structure may be permitted for Top Elevation of 45 m AMSL with the specified CNS conditions.

12. M/s GVK MIAL, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/MIAL/017
File No.: AAI/20012/140/2012-ARI(NOC)

Adhikari

NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/070712/004
Site Address: Santacruz Airport, Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 578m away from Rwy 14 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 50m AMSL for building A, B, C, D, E, F, G, H and I & 46 m AMSL for building E vide their letter dated 09.07.2012 against which authorization were issued for points A-25.05 m AMSL, B-25.88 m AMSL, C-26.10 m AMSL, D-26.94 m AMSL, E-26.80 m AMSL, F-26.71 m AMSL, G-26.65 m AMSL, H-26.34 m AMSL and I-24.66 m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 14.09.2012(NOC not issued). Appellate Committee, in their meeting held on 09.01.2013, issued directives to carry out CNS simulation study.

After the simulation study conducted by AAI, following are the permissible heights according to AGA, IAL and CNS conditions:

AGA-56.9 m AMSL, IAL-50 m AMSL and CNS-45 m AMSL.

The proposed structure may be permitted for top elevation 45 m AMSL subject to following conditions:

- a) These are confined to the specified coordinates
- b) The exterior is made of glass (non-metallic)
- c) As the structures are within the operational area and may affect the future expansion of CNS facilities, in that case, applicant shall provide suitable space & shall bear the cost of trans-installation/relocation expenses.

Committees' Decision: The proposed structure may be permitted for Top Elevation of 45 m AMSL with the specified CNS conditions.

13. M/s GVK MIAL, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/NOCAS/MIAL/013
File No.: AAI/20012/139/2012-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/070712/005
Site Address: Santacruz Airport, Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 568.91m away from Rwy 14 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 50m AMSL vide their letter dated 10.07.2012 against which authorization were issued for points A-27.02 m AMSL, B-28.40 m AMSL, C-28.15 m AMSL, D-26.75 m AMSL vide AAI letter dated 14.09.2012(NOC not issued). Appellate Committee, in their meeting held on 09.01.2013, issued directives to carry out CNS simulation study.

Asinha

After the simulation study conducted by AAI, following are the permissible heights according to AGA, IAL and CNS with conditions:

AGA-56.9 m AMSL, IAL-50.05 m AMSL and CNS-45 m AMSL.

The proposed structure may be permitted for top elevation 45 m AMSL subject to following conditions:

- a) These are confined to the specified coordinates
- b) The exterior is made of glass (non-metallic)
- c) As the structures are within the operational area and may affect the future expansion of CNS facilities, in that case, applicant shall provide suitable space & shall bear the cost of trans-installation/relocation expenses.

Committees' Decision: The proposed structure may be permitted for Top Elevation of 45 m AMSL with specified CNS conditions.

14. M/s Housing Dev. & Infra. Ltd., Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/11/46
File No.: AAI/20012/52/2011-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/090512/017
Site Address: CTS No.232, 233 of Village Mulgaon & CTS No. 16(Pt) of Village Chakala, Andheri(East), Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 1958 m away from Rwy 14 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 90.00 m AMSL vide their letter dated 13.01.2011 against which they were granted a height of 56.27 AMSL vide letter dated 08.04.2011. The applicant again requested a revised height of 80.80 m AMSL vide letter dated 25.04.2013.

The case was discussed in the meeting of 30th April, 2013 wherein the Aeronautical Study was ordered.

The Aeronautical Study report submitted in this meeting indicates following top elevation are permitted against the criterias mentioned:

PANS-OPS: 80.80 m AMSL.

CNS:

- (i) 76.25 m AMSL from CNS point of view while considering the present ASR only.
- (ii) 80.80 m AMSL from CNS point of view while considering the proposed ASR at Kalina gate.

Aswaha

Committees' Decision: Authorisation for height of 80.80 m AMSL be issued to NOC issuing authority after the proposed ASR at Kalina is operational and till such time NOC for height of 76.25 m AMSL be issued.

15. M/s Housing Dev. & Infra. Ltd., Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/11/44
File No.: AAI/20012/50/2011-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/071512/006
Site Address: CTS No.60(Pt) and 17 of Village Chakala, Andheri(East), Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 1895 m away from Rwy 14 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 90.00 m AMSL vide their letter dated 13.01.2011 against which they were granted a height of 56.27 AMSL vide letter dated 08.04.2011. The applicant again requested a revised height of 77.7 m AMSL vide letter dated 20.03.2013.

The case was earlier discussed in the meeting of 30th April, 2013 wherein the Aeronautical Study was ordered.

The Aeronautical Study report submitted in this meeting wherein following top elevation are permitted:

PANS-OPS: 77.70 m AMSL.

CNS:

- (i) 59.76 m AMSL from CNS point of view while considering the present ASR only.
- (ii) 73.30 m AMSL from CNS point of view while considering the proposed ASR at Kalina gate.

Committees' Decision: The revised height of 77.7 m AMSL sought is not admissible. Authorisation for height of 73.30 m AMSL after ASR at Kalina gate is operational and for a height of 59.76 m AMSL with existing radar be issued to NOC issuing authority.

16. M/s Housing Dev. & Infra. Ltd., Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/11/45
File No.: AAI/20012/51/2011-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/090512/014
Site Address: CTS No.16(Pt) of Village Chakala, Andheri(East), Mumbai.

The site lies in the IHS and is 2004 m away from Rwy 14 of Santacruz Airport.

Asintha

The applicant had initially requested a height of 90.00 m AMSL vide their letter dated 13.01.2011 against which they were granted a height of 56.27 AMSL vide letter dated 07.04.2011. The applicant again requested a height of 79.91 m AMSL vide letter dated 25.04.2013.

The case was discussed in the Appellate Committee Meeting of 30th April, 2013 wherein the Aeronautical Study was ordered.

The Aeronautical Study report submitted in this meeting wherein following top elevation are permitted:

PANS-OPS: 79.91 m AMSL.


CNS:

- (i) 60.62 m AMSL from CNS point of view while considering the present ASR only.
- (ii) 74.36 m AMSL from CNS point of view while considering the proposed ASR at Kalina gate.

Committees' Decision: The revised height of 79.91 m AMSL sought is not admissible. Authorisation for height of 74.36 m AMSL after ASR at Kalina gate is operational and for a height of 60.62 m AMSL with existing radar be issued to NOC issuing authority.


(V.SOMASUNDARAM)
MEMBER (ANS), AAI


(K.GOHAIN)
TECHNICAL EXPERT


(ALOK SINHA)
JT. SECY, MOCA
CHAIRMAN, APPELLATE COMMITTEE

Place: New Delhi
Date: 7th February, 2014