

**Ministry of Civil Aviation
Rajiv Gandhi Bhawan, New Delhi-110003**

**Minutes of the Meeting of the Appellate Committee for height clearance held on
30th April, 2015**

Reference Ministry of Civil Aviation letter No. AV.20036/66/2000-AAI dated 15-10-2012 read with letters dated 31-12-2012 and dated 04-01-2013, the Appellate Committee constituted to consider appeal/grievance made by different applicants with regard to the height allocated to them by AAI for their construction vis-à-vis the height sought by them, held its meeting under the Chairmanship of Joint Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation (MOCA) on 30th April, 2015.

The following Committee members were present:-

- | | | | |
|----|---------------------|---|-------------------|
| 1. | Sh. V. Somasundaram | - | Member (ANS), AAI |
| 2. | Sh. J.S. Rawat | - | Jt. DGCA |
| 2. | Sh. K. Gohain | - | Technical Expert |

The following decisions were taken for the appeal cases that were brought up in this Committee Meeting:

1. Shri Mohan T. Kukreja, Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/374
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/59/2014
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/030114/22316
Site Address: CTS No.177B of Village Chembur, Mumbai, Suburbab District in M West ward, Tal.Kurla, Village Chembur, Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3656m from Rwy 32 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 81.80 m AMSL vide letter dated 30.06.2013 against which they were granted a height of 56.90 m AMSL vide letter dated 11.12.2013. The applicant in its letter dated 28.01.2014 had asked for a higher height of 102 m AMSL and thereafter requested for a reduced height of 82m AMSL vide their subsequent letter dated 10.5.2014.

The case was earlier heard in the Appellate Committee Meeting held on 12th May, 2014 wherein it was decided that the applicant needs to provide letter from the local authorities justifying the project and also recommending the height for the same.

MCGM letter dated 09.05.14 was submitted (In Original) in April 2015. However, MCGM letter is addressed to the applicant with no specific justification and recommendation of the desired height.

The case was heard in the meeting. However, the representative of the applicant appearing before the committee could not give background of the case and also justification from their end for the higher height requirement.

Committees' Decision:

The case to be adjourned to the next meeting.

2. M/s S. B Developers, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/02
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/112/2014
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/122413/19388
Site Address: CTS No. 475 (pt), Plot No.-B of Village Kurla Kurla, Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is at a distance of 2982m from Rwy 32 of Santa Cruz Airport

The applicant had initially requested a height of 104.55m AMSL vide letter dated 02.01.2014 against which they were granted a height of 56.90 m AMSL vide letter dated 15.04.2014. The applicant in its subsequent letter dated 07.06.2014 has requested for a reduced height of 81m AMSL and has requested for an Aeronautical Study to consume full FSI.

The applicant has submitted MHADA Letter dated 01.08.14. (In Original)

The case was initially listed in the Appellate Committee meeting held on 21st January, 2015. The applicant was absent wherein it was decided that the case to be taken up after three months only after receipt of request from the applicant for appearing in the Appellate Committee meeting.

Applicant submitted his request vide email dated 20.03.15.

In this meeting, the applicant was present and had clarified that the plot is a MHADA plot which is about 5000 sqm. and that they have to rehabilitate 240 dwellers from existing dilapidate buildings. The Committee examined the MHADA letter dated 01.8.2014 which has justified the project and the height requirement.

Committees' Decision:

Aeronautical study to be conducted to determine whether the height of 81m AMSL is permissible at the site.

3. M/s S. B Developers, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/01
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/113/2014
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/122413/19387
Site Address: CTS No. 475(Pt), Plot No. -A of Village Kurla, Kurla, Mumbai

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is at a distance of 2929m from Rwy 32 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 105m AMSL vide letter dated 01.01.2014 against which they were granted a height of 56.90 m AMSL vide letter dated 15.04.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 07.06.2014 has requested for reduced height of 81m AMSL requesting for an Aeronautical Study to consume full FSI.

The applicant has submitted MHADA Letter dated 01.08.14 submitted. (In Original)

The case was initially heard in the Appellate Committee meeting held on 21st January, 2015. The applicant was absent, wherein it was decided that the case to be taken up after three months only after the applicant makes a request for appearing in the Appellate Committee.

Applicant submitted his request vide email dated 20.03.15.

The case was heard in this meeting, the applicant was present and had clarified that the plot is a MHADA plot and the building is required for rehabilitation purposes. The Committee examined the MHADA letter dated 1.8.2014 which has justified the project and the height requirement.

Committees' Decision:

Aeronautical study to be conducted to determine whether the height of 81m AMSL is permissible at the site.

4. M/s Accanoor Associates (Builders & Estate Developers), Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/501
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/136/2014
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/081413/15827
Site Address: CTS No. 64 of Village Ambivali at Jai Bhawani Mata Marg, Makadwadi, Andheri (East), Mumbai

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 3966m from Rwy 14 of Santa Cruz Airport.



The applicant had initially requested a height of 97.695m AMSL vide letter dated 20.08.2013 against they were granted a height of 56.90m AMSL vide letter dated 06.06.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 23.07.2014 has reiterated for the height of 97.695m AMSL and requested aeronautical study stating that it is a redevelopment project approved under Slum Rehabilitation Scheme for Slum dwellers.

The case was initially heard in the Appellate Committee meeting held on 22nd January, 2015 wherein the applicant informed that under Supreme Court's order they need to rehabilitate slum dwellers thereby they require to go higher was decided that the case to put up to the Committee after receipt of copy of the Supreme Court Order from the applicant.

Applicant vide letter dated 14.02.15 submitted copy of the Supreme Court judgment bearing Civil Appeal No.11150 of 2013. Applicant vide email dated 01.04.15 has informed that as they are not a party in the case whose judgment has been referred by us before the Appellate Committee, so it is difficult for them to obtain certified copy.

The applicant appeared before the committee and submitted the certified copy of the Supreme Court judgment as well as copies of letters / notes from the Municipal Commissioner directing all concerned for implementation of the Supreme Court's order. The Committee peruse the contents of above documents. The applicant during their presentation to the committee clarified that their project consists of two different towers and that to consume full FSI granted to them by the MCGM. They now require a revised height of 120.90m AMSL for both the towers (rehab and sale) and that they further clarified that their request of 23rd July, 2014 is for 97.695m AGL which translate to 120.90m AMSL. The committee also taking note of the above requirements revisited the SRA letter dated 19.1.2015 which has recommended the project and the height requirement.

Committees' Decision:

Aeronautical study to be conducted after receipt of co-ordinates of both the towers from the applicant to determine whether the height of 120.90m AMSL is permissible at the site for both the towers.

5. Shri Rajesh G. Jain, M/s Neumec Estate Developer LLP, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/506
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/37/2014
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/072913/15462
Site Address: FP No. 296 of TPS V, Vile Parle (East), Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 712m from Rwy 09 of Santa Cruz Airport

The applicant had initially requested a height of 55.37m AMSL vide letter dated 20.08.2013 and further 55.35m AMSL vide letter dated NIL received on 14.02.2014 against which they were granted a height of 36.74m AMSL vide letter dated 18.03.2014.

The applicant in its subsequent letter dated 22.08.2014 has requested for revised height of 49.22m AMSL.

The case was initially heard in the Appellate Committee meeting held on 22nd January, 2015, wherein it was decided that the applicant to submit the details of material on buildings external surface on receipt of which AAI would re-examine to determine the permissible height.

The applicant submitted MCGM letter dated 21.01.15 submitted (In Original) and has also submitted details of material vide letter dated 22.01.15.

The applicant was present in this meeting and had clarified that their request earlier was for 49.22m AGL which is also supported by the MCGM letter dated 21.1.2015. The committee was further informed that the height at the proposed site was earlier restricted to 36.74m AMSL due to UHF link and that based on the details of material on the building external surface as provided by the applicant and on re-examination from CNS criteria, the maximum permissible height at the site will be 46.96m AMSL due ELDIS radar. The applicant also requested the committee that they would consider using the type of material for the external surface, if they could be guided on the matter.

The committee taking note of the above also considered the fact that the height requested by the applicant i.e. 55.37m AMSL is permissible from AGA criteria and that the site is less than 2 Km from the KALINA ELDIS radar.

Committees' Decision:

The applicant to make a formal request to AAI for the type of material to be used by them on the external surface of the building which may enable them to get the height requested. Also the case to be re-examined from the multi radar criteria and the results to be brought forward to the committee.

6. Shri Nilesh H. Gunjal, C/o M/s Neumec Reality, Mumbai.

**Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/68
CHQ File No.: 20012/38/2014
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/112312/019
Site Address: F.P No.470 of TPS –V of Vile Parle (East), Mumbai.**

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 729m from Rwy 09 of Santa Cruz Airport

The applicant had initially requested a height of 56.27 m AMSL vide letter dated 01.02.2013 against which they were granted a height of 35.159 m AMSL vide letter dated 12.07.2013. The applicant in its letter dated 06.02.2014 has requested for review for height of 56.27m AMSL and in the subsequent letter dated 22.08.14 has appealed for height 46.32m AMSL. The applicant in its subsequent letter dated 22.1.2015 has



requested for height of 51.02m AMSL (which is 46.32m AGL + SE 4.708m) requesting additional height of 11.161m to utilize full FSI of the building.

The case was heard in Appellate Committee meeting held on 22nd January, 2015., wherein it was decided that the applicant to submit the details of material on the buildings external surface on receipt of which AAI would reexamine to determine the permissible height.

The applicant submitted MCGM letter dated 21.01.15 (In Original) and also submitted details of material vide letter dated 22.01.15.

The applicant was present in this committee and had clarified that their actual height requirement is 51.02m AMSL which is SE (4.7m) + 46.32m AGL. The committee was also informed that on re-examination from CNS criteria, it was found that the maximum permissible top elevation is 48.115m AMSL as building external surface has no bearing on functioning of UHF link and site is restricted due UHF link. The committee took note that inspite of shifting of UHF antenna, the permissible height remains 48.115m AMSL. The applicant accepted this height.

Committees' Decision:

Authorisation of a height of 48.115m AMSL to be issued.

7. Shri Ved Ram Singh, Executive Engineer, Ministry of Urban Development, New Delhi.

Case No.: NR/2014/47
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/58/2014
NOCAS ID: SAFD/NORTH/B/012114/20480
Site Address: GPRA, Sarojini Nagar, New Delhi.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** of Safdarjung Airport and in **approach surface** of IGI Airport.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site is 920m from Rwy 30 of Safdarjung Airport and is 7082m from basic strip of Rwy 27 of IGI Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 306.299 m AMSL vide letter dated 10.02.2014 against which they were granted a height of 260m AMSL vide letter dated 17.02.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 03.03.2014 has reiterated for height of 306.299 m AMSL. The applicant requested for higher height to fulfill the norms of MPD-2021 and stating that this redevelopment will enhance the supply/ availability of residential & commercial space in the heart of the city i.e. Sarojini Nagar.

The case was earlier heard in the Appellate Committee Meeting dated 22nd January, 2015 wherein the committee directed the applicant to submit their revised height request below 48 m. The Committee further directed AAI to review the case if higher height can be permitted to this site through Aeronautical Study.

Applicant vide letter dated 06.02.15 has revised their request to 270.849m AMSL and had stated that the above height is required for redevelopment of Sarojini Nagar GPRA.

The applicant was present in this meeting and had reiterated the height requirement of 48m AGL as given in their letter of 6.2.15 and also explained that the area of plot of 288 acres extends from Sarojini Nagar near to Safdarjung Airport towards Moti Bagh. It was further informed that the site elevation of the plot varies from 215m to 222.849m.

This Committee was informed that on examination from PAN-OPS criteria, the permissible top elevation is 286m AMSL due to OCA of G.P Inoperative procedure of IHS Rwy 27 of IGI Airport and site cannot be assessed through Aeronautical Study for Safdarjung Airport as it is VFR airport. The committee also noted that the circuit altitude of Safdarjung airport is 700 Ft. (210m AGL) only. The committee also took note of the restrictions imposed w.r.t Safdarjung Airport from other factors. The applicant proposed that since the site elevation of the plot varies from 215m to 222.849m, can they take advantage of the lower site elevation to get more height above ground level. The Committee agreed to the proposal of the applicant to avail advantage of varying site elevation for different AGL heights of buildings in the plot subject to restricting the top of all the buildings to permissible elevation.

Committees' Decision:

A revised authorization indication permissible height of 260m AMSL without indicating height above ground to be issued.

8. Shri Kishore D Patel, M/s Wooden Boxes Manufactures Co-Op. Industrial Estate Ltd., Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/10/639
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/78/11
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/123113/19609
Site Address: CTS No. 1/7 (Pt.),1/8A (Sub Plot-A1),Village Ghatkopar, Mumbai

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Conical Surface** and is at a distance of 4568m from Rwy 27 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 177.33m AMSL vide letter dated 10.03.2011 against which they were granted a height of 84.27m AMSL vide letter dated 21.03.2011. The applicant in its letter dated 05.10.2013 has requested for increased height of 242.12 m AMSL.

Applicant requested exemption from attending the meeting to be held on 16.4.2014 vide email dated 14.04.14.

The case was heard in the Appellate Committee Meeting dated 16th April, 2014 wherein it was decided that applicant to be called in the next meeting.



The Case was again later heard in Appellate Committee Meeting dated 11th July, 2014 wherein it was decided that on receipt of the revised request of the applicant the same to be examined for shielding benefit.

Applicant submitted his request vide letter dated 05.09.14 for reduced height of 175m AMSL by applying shielding benefit.

On examination from Shielding criteria, it was found that the contours are not clear on the Mumbai zoning map, however it appears that the controlling contour is 131 ft (39.44m AMSL). So the maximum permissible top elevation as per shielding criteria is 39.44m AMSL.

The case was subsequent brought up in the Appellate Committee Meeting dated 26th March, 2015. The applicant was absent and it was decided that the case to be taken up on receipt of intimation from applicant.

Applicant submitted his request to appear in the Committee meeting vide letter dated 26.03.15.

The applicant appeared before this Committee and submitted contour maps of that area and was claiming that Contour 175 gives shielding benefit for the height 175m AMSL, they have requested. The applicant also informed that the contour map has been certified by the Local Authorities i.e. MCGM.

Committees' Decision:

The Contour Map submitted by the applicant to be verified from the issuing / certificating authorities and thereafter physical verification of the site to be carried through Local Mumbai Office.

9. Shri Kishore D Patel, M/s Wooden Boxes Manufactures Co-Op. Industrial Estate Ltd., Mumbai

Case No.: MUM/11/233
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/179/11
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/123113/19608
Site Address: CTS No. 1/7 (Pt.), (Plot No. -A3), Village Ghatkopar, Mumbai

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Conical Surface** and is at a distance of 4883m from Rwy 27 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 242.12m AMSL vide letter dated 07.04.2011 against which they were granted a height of 99.47m AMSL vide letter dated 09.09.2011. The applicant in its letter dated 05.10.2013 has revised their request for height of 242.12 m AMSL.

Applicant requested for exemption from attending the meeting to be held on 16.4.2014 vide email dated 14.04.14.

The case was listed in the Appellate Committee Meeting dated 16th April, 2014 wherein it was decided that applicant to be called in the next meeting on receipt of request from them.

The case was heard in Appellate Committee Meeting dated 11th July, 2014 wherein it was decided that on receipt of the revised request of the applicant the same to be examined for shielding benefit.

Applicant submitted his request for reduced height of 185m AMSL vide letter dated 05.09.14 by applying shielding benefit.

On examination from Shielding criteria, it was found that the contours are not clear on the Mumbai zoning map, however it appears that the controlling contour is 328 ft (100m AMSL). So the maximum permissible top elevation as per shielding criteria is 100m AMSL.

The case was put up in the Appellate Committee Meeting dated 26th March, 2015. The applicant was absent and it was decided that the case to be taken up on receipt of intimation from applicant.

Applicant submitted his request for appearing in the meeting vide letter dated 26.03.15. The applicant was present in this meeting and in the presentation claimed that according to the contour maps which they have submitted, the Contour 185 provides shielding benefits to their requested height. The applicant also informed during the presentation that the contour map submitted by them now has been approved by MCGM.

Committees' Decision:

The Contour Map submitted by the applicant to be verified from the issuing / certificating authorities and thereafter physical verification of the site to be carried through Local Mumbai Office.

10. M/s Sanjay Chhabriya, C/o M/s Wadhwa & Deserve Builders LLP, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/223
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/143/2014-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/042614/36963
Site Address: CTS No. 200(Pt.) of Village Wadhavali ME Ward, Chembur (East), Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Conical Surface** and is 5589m away from Rwy 32 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 200m AMSL vide letter dated 02.05.2014 against which they were granted a height of 120.40m AMSL vide letter



dated 04.07.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 30.07.2014 has increased the height requirement to 210m AMSL.

The applicant requested Aeronautical Study stating that his project is a slum development project rehabilitating 902 tenants.

The applicant submitted SRA letter dated 22.07.2014 which was not in original.

The case was heard in Appellate Committee meeting on 26th March, 2015. The Committee took note of the SRA letter which was not in original and it was decided that the applicant to submit SRA letter in original categorically recommending the height for the concerned building.

The applicant subsequent submitted SRA Letter dated 22.07.14 in original.

This Committee heard the applicant who reiterated that it is under the SRA scheme and the height is required for rehabilitating the 902 tenants and that the height is required to consume the FSI granted by the Local Authorities. The Committee took note of the SRA letter dated 22.7.2014, which is in original and supports the project and justifies height requirement.

Committees' Decision:

Aeronautical study to be conducted to determine whether the height requested 210m AMSL is permissible or not at the site.

11. Mr. Sanjay Chabriya, M/s Wadhwa & Deserve Builders LLP., Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/742
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/145/2014
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/120513/18858
Site Address: CTS No. 200 (Pt) of Village Wadhavali, Mumbai

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Conical Surface** and is 5695m away from Rwy 32 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 185 m AMSL vide letter dated 13.12.2013 against which they were granted a height of 120.40 m AMSL vide letter dated 31.03..2014. The applicant in its letter dated 30.07.2014 has increased the height requirement to 210m AMSL.

The applicant requested Aeronautical Study stating that his project is a slum development project rehabilitating 902 tenants. The applicant submitted SRA letter dated 22.07.2014, which was not in original.

The case was heard in the earlier Appellate Committee meeting on 26th March, 2015. The Committee took note of the SRA letter which was not in original and it was decided

that the applicant to submit SRA letter in original categorically recommending the height for the concerned building.

The applicant subsequent submitted SRA Letter dated 22.07.14 in original.

This Committee heard the applicant who reiterated that it is under the SRA scheme and the height is required for rehabilitating the 902 tenants and that the height is required to consume the FSI granted by the Local Authorities. The Committee took note of the SRA letter dated 22.7.2014, which is in original and supports the project and justifies height requirement.

Committees' Decision

Aeronautical study to be conducted to determine whether the height requested 210m AMSL is permissible or not at the site.

12. M/s Om Sai Enterprise Builders & Developers, Shri Jayantibhai Parasia, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/161
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/56/2014-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST /B/022213/006
Site Address: CTS No. 20(Pt),Bldg No. 127 of Village Chembur, Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Approach Surface** and is at a distance of 2270 m from basic strip of Rwy 32 of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 56.47m AMSL vide letter dated 18.04.2013 against which they were granted a height of 52.21m AMSL vide letter dated 08.10.2013. The applicant in its letter dated nil has requested for an increased higher height of 72m AMSL. Applicant requested aeronautical study to consume full FSI.

The case was put up for the Appellate Committee meeting held on 21st January, 2015. The applicant was absent and it was decided that the case to be taken up after three months only after the applicant makes a request for appearing in the Appellate Committee.

Applicant submitted his request to appear before the Committee in his letter dated 10.3.2015.

This Committee heard the applicant who stated that his plot belong to MHADA and measures 1386.45 sqm. Initially he was to rehabilitate 80 tenements under MHADA Scheme and subsequently he was given enhance FSI 3 to accommodate 126 tenements. The applicant stated that he is prepared to go for lower height up to a minimum of 61.57m AMSL and that he will make a formal application for the same. The Committee further took note that the plot lies inside the approach funnel for Rwy 32. This was contested by the applicant when he was informed and shown that as far the coordinates of the plot provided by him, the NOCAS system has positioned the plot



inside the approach funnel and therefore, the maximum height permissible is from AGA Criteria.

Committees' Decision:

The appeal for enhanced height of 72m AMSL at the site is rejected.

13. Shri Dipesh Bhagtani, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/70
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/57/2014-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/WEST/B/102213/17288
Site Address: CTS No. 11H of Village Chandivali, S.M Shetty School at Powai, Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in Inner Horizontal Surface at a distance of 3534 m from Rwy 27 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had earlier applied for a height of 139.71 m AMSL vide letter dated 04.02.2013 against which they were granted 56.90 m AMSL vide letter dated 12.02.2014. The applicant has reiterated the height to 139.71 m AMSL vide letter dated 11.03.2014 requesting Aeronautical Study to consume full FSI. The applicant had subsequent in the letter dated 17.4.2015 requested for reduced height of 93.84m AMSL.

The Case was brought up in Appellate Committee meeting dated 11th July, 2014. The applicant was absent for this meeting and it was decided that the applicant to be called for next meeting only on receipt of request from him. Applicant submitted his request vide letter dated 19.03.15 for appearing in the Committee meeting.

The Committee in this meeting was informed that the applicant had submitted MCGM letter dated 11.03.15 submitted (In Original). The applicant in this meeting made his presentation, wherein he made renewed request that since his site elevation is high (45.87m) he needs atleast 76.70m AGL to consume full FSI and that his request made in this meeting was for 122.57m AMSL. The applicant was informed that the height (AMSL) requested by him would not be feasible, even if aeronautical study is conducted. The applicant then revised his request to 118m AMSL.

The MCGM letter dated 11.3.2015 submitted by the applicant was examined by this Committee and it was observed that the letter states that the plan for full consumption of FSI are under scrutiny and does not categorically justify the project and has not recommended any specific height for consumption of the FSI as contended by the applicant in the meeting.

Committees' Decision:

The appeal for conduct of aeronautical study and for height of 118m AMSL is rejected.

14. M/s Shree Siddheshwar SSK Ltd. Solapur, (Maharashtra).

Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/CHIMNEY/SOLAPUR/02
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/181/2014-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SOLA/WEST/B/031814/23773
Site Address: Survey No. 21/4, Village Kumathe, Tal. North Solapur, Dist. Solapur, Maharashtra.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Approach Surface** and is 989 m from Rwy 33 of Solapur Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 553 AMSL vide letter dated 27.03.2014 against which they were authorised a height of 504m AMSL vide letter dated 01.05.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 18.10.2014 has reiterated the height of 553 m AMSL.

The applicant requested higher height to develop MS structure of 47m height and also to construct RCC Chimney of 90m height (137m AGL)

The case was listed in meeting dated 26.3.2015. However, the applicant appeared and requested for another date and it was decided that the case to be brought up in the next meeting.

The applicant was called for this meeting to present his case. However, the applicant was absent without any intimation.

Committees' Decision:

The applicant to be called after 3 months only after receipt of application from him.

15. M/s Gliders Buildcon LLP, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/483
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/14/2015-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/021914/21773
Site Address: C.S.No.(s) 595 of Mazagaon Division in E Ward, Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Outer Horizontal Surface** and is 12614m from ARP of Santacruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 357.34 AMSL vide letter dated 07.08.2013 against which they were granted a height of 276.54m AMSL vide letter dated 08.04.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 26.11.2014 has reduced the height requirement to 308.30 AMSL.

Applicant requested higher height to consume full FSI/FAR and make the project viable.



Applicant vide email dated 09.03.2015 requested extension of time for appearing before Appellate Committee.

The case was heard in Appellate Committee meeting on 26th March, 2015 and it was decided that the case to be brought up in the next Appellate Committee meeting.

This Committee examined the letter of the MCGM and also heard the presentation made by the applicant. The applicant on being queried informed that his total site area was 14 acre of which only 35% is being allowed for construction of the building. He also expressed that the building for which the height is sought is in addition to the rehab building and that he has to construct 142 flats for economic weaker section. The Committee noted that the applicant had not made any request for aeronautical study and that the site is in the OHS at a distance of more than 12 Km. from Mumbai Airport ARP.

Committees' Decision:

AAI to review the case from CNS and PANOPS parameters and grant the admissible height to the applicant.

16. M/s Saurashtra Chemicals., Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/12/PB/NOCAS/390
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/78/2013-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: PORB/WEST/B/062012/014
Site Address: Survey No. 22, Porbandar-360575, Taluka Dist Porbandar.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** at about 3774 m away from Rwy 09 of Porbandar Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 76.555 m AMSL vide their letter dated 26.10.2012 against which they were granted a height of 52.015 m AMSL vide letter dated 20.02.2013. The applicant in its letters dated 16.01.2014 and 10.06.2014 has reiterated for height of 76.55 m AMSL requesting higher height to make his project viable.

The Case was listed in Appellate Committee meeting held on 30th January, 2014 wherein they were absent and Committee decided that the applicant may be given a new date on receipt of application from them for appearing in the meeting.

The Case was again listed in subsequent Appellate Committee meeting held on 7th March, 2014 wherein it was decided that the applicant to be called in the next meeting.

The Case was thereafter listed and heard in Appellate Committee meeting held on 16th April 2014 wherein it was decided that the applicant is to submit detailed proposal supported by local body and other agencies justifying the requirement of 76.55 m AMSL height for the chimney stack.

The applicant vide letter dated 10.06.2014 have re-submitted copies of Gujarat Pollution Control Board letter dated 30.07.2011.

The subsequent Committee meeting of 11-07-2014 heard the applicant after examining the proposal and observed that the height required is justified from the environmental angle as stated by the Gujarat Pollution Control Board for the Kiln which was issued on 30.07.2011 but the support and justification for the project from local body is still not available. In the meeting of 11th July, 2014, the Committee decided that the applicant to submit proposal duly supported and justified by local body.

The applicant thereafter submitted the Porbandar Nagar Seva Sadan letter dated 26.08.2014 (in original) and a letter from Porbandar District Chamber of Commerce and Industries letter dated 22.08.2014 (in original).

This Committee took note of the letters submitted by the applicant from Pollution Control Board and others as stated above and observed that the case involves construction of Kiln where justification exists for requisite height for pollution control and also in view that Porbandar airport is sparingly used and has limited traffic, the height admissible has to be determined by an Aeronautical Study.

The Case was heard in Appellate Committee meeting held on 16th January, 2015 and it was decided that Aeronautical Study be carried out at the site to determine the permissible height for the Kiln.

Applicant vide letter dated 16.03.15 requested for a single aeronautical study which should cover both Lime Kiln and Chimney instead of two separate aeronautical study as Lime Kiln and Chimney both are situated in same plant premises at a distance around 300m.

The applicant was called for this meeting and they explained their request in the light of co-location of the chimney and the Lime Kiln both situated in the same plant premises which they showed on a plan diagram.

Committees' Decision:

The applicant's request for conduct of single aeronautical study for the site including chimney and kiln (case No. MUM/12/EB/NOCAS/390 and MUM/13/NOCAS/CHIM/PR/04) is acceded to.

17. M/s Saurashtra Chemicals., Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/13/NOCAS/CHIM/PR/04
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/08/2014-ARI(NOC)
NOCAS ID: PORB/WEST/B/062012/012
Site Address: Survey No. 9/2, Village Chhaya, Taluka & Dist Porbandar.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in **Inner Horizontal Surface** at about 3459 m away from Rwy 09 of Porbandar Airport.



The applicant had initially requested a height of 107.94 m AMSL online dated 20.06.2012 against which they were granted a height of 52.01 m AMSL vide letter dated 15.10.2013. The applicant in its letters dated 22.11.2013 reiterated a height of 107.94 and vide letter dated 10.06.2014 has requested for a height of 107.00 m AMSL requesting higher height as per their factory's statutory requirement under various provisions of applicable laws.

The Case was heard in Appellate Committee meeting held on 16th April, 2014 wherein the Committee took note of the standards for the chimney stack heights as given by the Pollution Control Board. The applicant vide letter dated 10.06.14 have resubmitted copies of Gujarat Pollution Control Board letter dated 30.07.2011.

In the subsequent Committee meeting of 11th July, 2014, the applicant during the hearing in this meeting when queried of the letter of the Gujarat Pollution Control Board of July, 2011 indicated that they had already constructed the Chimney as per the said letter. They were asked again to submit support letter justifying the height requirement from local body and other agencies.

The applicant thereafter submitted the Porbandar Nagar Seva Sadan letter dated 26.08.2014 (in original) and a letter from Porbandar District Chamber of Commerce and Industries dated 22.08.2014(in original) in support of their request for higher height for the chimney stack.

This Committee took note of the letters submitted by the applicant from Pollution Control Board and others as stated above and observed that the case involves construction of chimney where justification exists for requisite height for pollution control and also in view that Porbandar airport is sparingly used and has limited traffic, the height admissible has to be determined by an Aeronautical Study.

The Case was heard in Appellate Committee meeting held on 16th January, 2015 and it was decided that Aeronautical Study be carried out at the site to determine the permissible height.

Applicant vide letter dated 16.03.15 requested for a single aeronautical study which should cover both Lime Kiln and Chimney along instead of two separate aeronautical study as Lime Kiln and Chimney both are situated in same plant premises at a distance around 300m.

The applicant was called for this meeting and they explained their request in the light of co-location of the chimney and the Lime Kiln both situated in the same plant premises which they showed on a plan diagram.

Committees' Decision:

The applicant's request for conduct of single aeronautical study for the site including chimney and kiln (case No. MUM/12/EB/NOCAS/390 and MUM/13/NOCAS/CHIM/PR/04) is acceded to.

18. M/s Anik Industries Limited, Shri Shivam Asthana, Kolkata.

Case No.: ER/367/2014
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/12/2015
NOCAS ID: KOLK/EAST/B/080514/54668
Site Address: 30-1111,Plot No.BG-9,Mouza-Thakdari, Newtown, Kolkata.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in outer **Conical Surface** and is 6992m from Rwy 01R of Kolkata Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 106.45m AMSL online dated 05.08.2014 against which they were granted a height of 51m AMSL vide letter dated 09.12.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 07.01.2015 has requested for a reduced height of 83.45m AMSL requesting higher height quoting that the other buildings in the said area have been provided a greater height than which they have been granted.

This Committee was informed that the applicant had submitted New Town Kolkata Development Authority Letter dated 05.01.15 (In Original).

This Committee examined the letter submitted by the Local Authority and also took note that the site is in the outer conical surface nearly 7 Km. from Rwy 01R of Kolkata Airport. The Committee sought clarity as to whether the site is within or outside the ILS procedure for Rwy 01R.

Committees' Decision:

AAI to review the case to determine whether the site is within or outside the ILS procedure for Rwy 01R and the matter to be brought up in the next meeting.

19. Shri Adhyatma B.Gupta, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/401
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/19/2015
NOCAS ID: SNCR/WEST/B/070814/47055
Site Address: CTS No. 5436-A of Village Kolkalyan, Santa Cruz (E), Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies on **Inner Horizontal Surface** and is 1857m from Rwy 32 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 75.15m AMSL vide letter dated 21.08.2014 against which they were granted a height of 48.51m AMSL vide letter dated 09.10.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 10.02.2015 has reiterated for height of 75.15m AMSL requesting aeronautical survey to consume full FSI and also stating that there are tall buildings in their entire locality.

The applicant requested exemption for attending the meeting vide Mail dated 30.4.2015 and asked for hearing in the next meeting.



Committees' Decision:

The applicant to be called in next Appellate Committee meeting.

20. M/s Mayfair Housing Pvt. Ltd., Shri Nayan A. Shah, Mumbai.

**Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/445
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/20/2015
NOCAS ID: JUHU/WEST/B/080514/54684
Site Address: F.P No. 199 of TPS-IV of Santa Cruz (West) at South Avenue Road, Santa Cruz (West), Mumbai**

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in IHS and is 1806m from Rwy 09 of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 78.90m AMSL vide letter dated 05.08.2014 against which they were granted a height of 56.90m AMSL vide letter dated 30.10.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 10.02.2015 has reiterated for height of 78.90m AMSL requesting aeronautical survey to consume full FSI and also stating that the existing building is over 50 years old in dilapidated condition which requires demolition and reconstruction as per prevailing Development Control Regulations.

The applicant made their presentation in this Committee's meeting in which they stressed that they have got the FSI after having to surrender areas as per Mumbai DC Regulations for development of green area, parking, roads etc. They also clarified that their project is supported by the State Government in its redevelopment program of old dilapidated buildings and for which they have to rehabilitate the original tenements, free of cost. The Committee noted that the applicant had not submitted any letter from the MCGM Authorities justifying the project and recommending specific height for consumption of FSI as granted by the Local State Authorities.

Committees' Decision:

The applicant to submit letter from the State Authority (MCGM) justifying the project and recommending specific height for consumption of FSI as granted by the Local State Authorities.

21. M/s Om Sai Builders & Developers, Mumbai.

**Case No.: MUM/14/NOCAS/389
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/21/2015
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/WEST/B/073114/53464
Site Address: CTS No.1(Pt) of Village Sahar, CTS No. 118(Pt) of Village Bamanwada and CTS No.632 of Village Chakala at Andheri East, Mumbai**

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in IHS and is 692m from Rwy 14 of Santa Cruz Airport and also lies in **Approach Surface** of Juhu Airport and is 2152m from basic strip of Rwy 26 of Juhu Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 60.633m AMSL vide letter dated 07.08.2014 against which they were granted a height of 44.16m AMSL vide letter dated 07.10.2014. The applicant in its letter dated 06.02.2015 has requested for a reduced height of 54.90m AMSL requesting higher height to utilize full FSI and to make SRA project economically viable. Applicant also requested for review based on existing ASR/MSSR communication limits and Multiple radar benefit.

The applicant requested for grant of next available date through mail dated 29.4.2015.

Committees' Decision:

The applicant to be called in next Appellate Committee meeting.

22. Shri Rajendra K. Kothari, M/s Spaceage Consultants, Mumbai.

Case No.: MUM/11/297
CHQ File No.: AAI/20012/62/2013
NOCAS ID.: SNCR/WEST/B/122313/19373
Site Address: CTS No. 12 (Pt) of Matunga Division at Dr. B.A Road, Dadar (West), Mumbai.

As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in outer conical surface and is 3816m from **Inner Horizontal Surface** of Santa Cruz Airport.

The applicant had initially requested a height of 225m AMSL vide letter dated 26.05.2011 against which they were granted a height of 145.35m AMSL vide letter dated 21.10.2011. The applicant in its letter dated 16.10.2014 has requested a reduced height of 220.55m AMSL requesting aeronautical study to consume full FSI.

MCGM Letter No. EB/4708/FN/A dated 22.08.14 submitted (In Original).

This Committee was informed that as per physical verification report by M/s MIAL, there are two buildings under construction Tower- A and Tower –B .For Tower- A top elevation could not be measured due construction work and for Tower B top elevation was measured to be 91.20m AMSL.

This Committee took note of the above note of MIAL and the height (145.35m AMSL) already granted to them by AAI in 21.10.2011. This Committee also examined the MCGM letter of 22.8.2014 and it observed that the letter does not justify the project nor recommend specific height required to consume FSI granted by the MCGM



Committees' Decision:

The applicant to submit letter from the State Authority (MCGM) justifying the project and recommending specific height for consumption of FSI as granted by the Local State Authorities.

23. Airports Authority of India Project at Lengpui Airport

Case No.: Proposal for 2nd DVOR
CHQ File No.: AAI/CNS-P/LP 2nd DVOR
NOCAS ID.:
Site Address: Lengpui Airport

The Committee was informed in this meeting that there are two sites for DVOR at Lengpui Airport which are as follows :

- i) **Site 1 (Existing DVOR)** :It is at longitudinal distance of 82.60m from Rwy 35 threshold towards north and at lateral distance of 220m towards east from Rwy centre line.

Maximum permissible height due AGA criteria is 432.79m AMSL with site elevation 433.43m AMSL.

According to AAI, for the requested height of 450.43m AMSL this site is clear from all Comm-Nav aids facilities as it is beyond the coverage of LLZ & GP.

- ii) **Site 2 (Hmunpui Hill top site for DVOR-II):** As per NOCAS, the proposed site lies in conical surface and is 489.8m beyond IHS of Lengpui Airport.

The Committee was informed that maximum permissible height at this site due AGA & CNS criteria is 495.60m AMSL and 546.626m AMSL respectively against the requested height of 968.20m AMSL (Site elevation is 958.20m AMSL).

The Committee took note of the above review of AAI and also that since the Lengpui Airport is already on high terrain surrounded by higher terrain and also vagaries of weather at that location, the DVORs both existing and proposed will enable more precise navigational information for safe aircraft operation into that airport.

Committees' Decision:

The Committee recommends the proposed DVOR on Hmunpui Hill Top together with appropriate NOTAM action with regards to its location and extant of obstructions.

Decision on cases rejected by Appellate Committee

It was brought to the notice of Appellate Committee that a number of request are being received to review the cases once rejected by the Committee.

Committees' Decision:

Committee decided that cases which have been rejected by it need not to be considered again.


(V.SOMASUNDARAM)
MEMBER (ANS), AAI


(J.S. RAWAT)
JT. DGCA


(K.GOHAIN)
TECHNICAL EXPERT


(ARUN KUMAR)
JT. SECY, MOCA
CHAIRMAN, APPELLATE COMMITTEE

Place: New Delhi
Date: 30 April 2015